

The Underground

Vol. 2, No. 1 / Spring 2012



Journal of Undergraduate Research
St. Lawrence University

Editorial Policy

THE UNDERGROUND is a peerreviewed journal that publishes the work of students whose creative endeavors reflect the issues of representation (i.e. PCA, Film, Gender, Fine Arts, Art History, etc.). The goal of this journal is to create an outlet which allows St. Lawrence students to share the results of their work with the rest of the academic community. All submissions must be original and reflective of the learning goals of the above mentioned fields and of St. Lawrence University. The journal will be published online once a semester. Each submission will undergo an editorial process based on a series of blind peer reviews. Submissions may go through a series of revisions. Each submission must have a faculty sponsor. Professors can either recommend the work directly to the journal or the individual authors may earn the sponsorship by asking professors with whom they produced the work that they would like to submit. All submissions must reflect the feedback and critique of the faculty sponsor before they are submitted. All work must be submitted in an electronic copy. Students can only submit two pieces of their work per semester. Submissions can include written pieces (plays, research papers, creative pieces, etc) and visual art (photography, videos of performances, etc.). Submissions should be sent by the time determined and announced by the editorial board and should be addressed to Juraj Kittler (jkittler@stlawu.edu).

Editorial Board

Jenae A. Nicoletta '12, Co-Editor-in-Chief
Zachary Choquette '13, Co-Editor-in-Chief

Samantha Foster '12

Jonathan Stopyra '13

Conner Eldridge '13

Ann West '13

Renee Lavigne '14

Jessica Perregaux '15

Art Editors

Evan Tear Haynes '12

Ilka Hadlock '13

Academic Adviser

Juraj Kittler, PhD

To the Reader:

Welcome! THE UNDERGROUND is back this spring with a third volume. For those of you who may have missed our last volume, this past fall we decided to expand the journal beyond the field of PCA to include any subject that deals with issues and analysis of representation. We firmly believe that this journal will embody the finest work regarding representation, while also promoting academic standing within the departments of PCA, Fine Arts, Film Studies, Gender and Sexualities Studies, and History. We are pleased with the expansion of this journal and the work we continue to receive. We hope to continue to receive a variety of remarkable submissions in the semesters to come.

In this issue, Claire Alai explores the paintings of Jacobello del Fiore as extensions of identity in association to cultural, social and mythic knowledge. Samantha Foster investigates the growth of propaganda as a scientific discipline during and after World War I. Paige Veidenheimer summarizes her findings regarding a lack of representation concerning Kerala, India in Western media outlets.

We would like to draw special attention to the three first year pieces we have chosen to showcase. First, Jessica Perregaux observes the use of manipulation of media images in American society and the 1998 film, *The Siege*. Hannah Ellerkamp utilizes the film *Land of Plenty* to illustrate the structural complexities of political economy. Emily Metzger uses the film *Syriana* to embark on a psychological exploration of a suicide bomber. We feel that these three first years have done excellent work and would like to encourage first year students to submit their work to THE UNDERGROUND.

To close this volume of the journal, Sophie Foreman shares her autoethnography, which questions if ethnic and cultural experiences truly affect basic human nature. Carla Ricci offers her dramaturgical research on Act 3, Scene 1 of Shakespeare's Romeo and Juliet. Isabel Borman dissects the colonial discourse rhetoric and the ways in which it relates to current popular Western online news media.

We congratulate all of our authors on their important and inspiring work. We hope you find their work thought provoking and enjoyable.

Sincerely,

Jenae Nicoletta '12 & Zachary Choquette '13
Co-Editors-in-Chief

Table of Contents

Painting the Venetian Republic: Jacobello del Fiore's Enthroned Justice as a vision of a new polity. By Claire Alai.....	1
Propaganda and Journalism in America: Creel, Lippmann, and Bernays as Critics and Innovators By Sam Foster.....	21
Keeping Kerala Secret: Media Coverage as an Indicator of Anti-Socialist Sentiment amongst Western Elites By Paige Veidenheimer.....	35
Constructed Reality: The Strength and Weakness of Visual Spectacles By Jessica Perregaux.....	47
Political Economy and the Marginalized: The Effects of an Exclusive Structure By Hannah Ellerkamp.....	53
Suicide Bombings: Terrorist Attack or Mourning Gone Wrong? By Emily Metzger.....	59
How People Connect: Determining What Defines the Ways in Which By Sophie Foreman.....	65
Romeo and Juliet: Interpreting the Language of Shakespeare's Play By Carla Ricci.....	77
Producing and Repruding Representations: A Study of Maasai and Maori in Mainstream Western Media By Isabel Borman.....	111

Painting the Venetian Republic: Jacobello del Fiore's Enthroned Justice as a Vision a New Polity

Abstract: The visual genealogy of Jacobello del Fiore's "Enthroned Justice Flanked by St. Michael the Archangel and the Angel Gabriel" reveals the links between ancient symbols of power and the political, religious, and cultural identity of Jacobello's Venice. Thus, to critically examine personifications of the Venetian state is to examine objects of projected glorification, triumph, and power. While allegorical representations of such *imagine figurata* appear in the form of early Roman and pre-Christian deities and later Medieval representations of *Justizia*, or Justice, they reappear as the Golden Age steadily approaches the shores of Venice. In harking back to systems of prehistoric mother-goddess and warrior worship, the Venetian commonwealth is made a palpable expression of a complex lineage. A culminating result is the overlay of local symbolism with non-local motifs. This looms over the work of Jacobello del Fiore, a state painter of the late 14th and early 15th century. Engulfed by the public project of adorning the *Palazzo Ducale*, a municipal building, Jacobello's "Enthroned Justice" perhaps most captivatingly, if not meaningfully, engages in the civic folklore of the Venetian city-state. This multifaceted image works to visually recode fable for fact. Ultimately, such installations sanctify Venetian monuments, for they authoritatively pattern the visual dialogue between state and citizen.

Key words: Renaissance painting; Jacobello del Fiore; proto-nationalism; virtue; Venetian Republic; Ducal Palace

Art functions as an extension of identity, yielding insight into a peoples' cultural, social, and mythic knowledge. The regions of Medieval Italy had rich and enduring artistic heritages, and the very act of collecting and examining visual and literary data allows for a deeper understanding of how the concept of place shapes cultural phenomena. The Venetian state in particular lends itself to such investigation, as it has been heavily veiled by its origin narrative, an omnipresent fiction referred to by scholars as the "myth of Venice". This myth not only relies on a fabricated past, but perhaps more significantly, a fabricated present. The "myth of Venice" has become so pervasive that its recirculation is mistaken for authenticity. Patricia Fortini Brown, a leading scholar in Venetian studies and author of *Venice and Antiquity: The Venetian Sense of the Past*, implicates the visual culture in this purposeful reconstruction of the past: "In essence, the special quality of the *renovation* of the thirteenth century was a *venezianita* grounded in what may be called 'aesthetic diversity'. It rested upon two major principles: accumulation, or aggregation, and incorporation (but not absorption). Tangible works that can be seen and touched—buildings, spolia, icons, mosaics, sculpture, artifacts—were more powerful than texts in creating civic identity of a reassuring historical density, for they were unmediated testimony: unprovable, therefore unchallengeable."¹ Thus, to critically examine personifications of the Venetian state is to examine objects of projected glorification, triumph, and power. While allegorical representations of such *imagine figurata* appear in the form of early Roman and pre-Christian deities and later Medieval representations of *Justizia*, they reappear as the Golden Age of the Renaissance steadily approaches the shores of Venice. In harking back to systems of prehistoric mother-goddess and warrior worship, the Venetian commonwealth is made a palpable expression of a complex lineage. A culminating result is the overlay of local symbolism with non-local motifs. This looms over the work of Jacobello del Fiore, a state painter of the late 14th and early 15th century. Engulfed by the public project of adorning the *Palazzo Ducale*, a municipal building, Jacobello's

1 Patricia Brown, *Venice & Antiquity: The Venetian Sense of the Past* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1996), 29.

“Enthroned Justice Flanked by St. Michael the Archangel and the Angel Gabriel” perhaps most captivatingly, if not meaningfully, engages in the civic folklore of the Venetian city-state. This multifaceted image works to visually recode fable for fact. Ultimately, such installations sanctify Venetian monuments, for they authoritatively pattern the visual dialogue between state and citizen. Images like Jacobello’s “Enthroned Justice” are not the amalgamation of fragmented images of governance, but the careful construction of territorial policy as it exists and is symbolically imagined, — the religious state draws from Byzantine and Roman references—and this serves to simultaneously delineate the rights of the sovereign power and to give contour to the borders and boundaries of Venetian citizenry.

The Object

In 1421 “Enthroned Justice” was completed for the commission of the Magistrato del Proprio, a group of judges overseeing property disputes. This was to be installed in the Palazzo Ducale, or the Doge’s Palace, in the offices of civil and criminal court, powerfully occupying a space above the officiated judges of the state.² David Rosand, author of *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State*, maintains: “the Doge was the symbolic embodiment of the Venetian state; his power, however, was severely restricted as Venice zealously guarded its republican virtue against potential tyranny or dynastic aspirations.”³ Thus, projecting an image of justice within the Council Hall chambers marked a crucial negotiation of real power and imagined authority. This piece does not occur in solitude, nor does it mark a stasis of civic image-making. It has motival connections with a larger body of paintings and statues made for public spaces in Venice such as Ambrogio Lorenzetti’s “Allegory of Good and Bad Government” of the Palazzo Pubblico in Siena. Aldo Cairola, author of *Simone Martini and Ambrogio Lorenzetti in the Town Hall of Siena*, describes the scene projected by Ambrogio’s “Allegory of Good Government” as it is placed in opposition to his “Allegory of Bad Government.”: “The principle

2 John T. Paoletti and Gary M. Radke, *Art in Renaissance Italy* (Upper Saddle River: Prentice Hall, INC., and Harry N. Abrams, INC., Publishers, 2002), 136.

3 David Rosand, *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 3.

symbols to be seen in *Allegory of the Good Government* are: *civil Virtue* and above, by *Faith, Hope, and Charity*, an old man wearing a white and black robe sitting on a rich throne with the scepter and seal of the Town Hall of Siena; his feet are resting on the Wolverine and the Twins nearby. Next to the Good Government, three on each side are; *Peace, Fortitude, Prudence, Magnanimity, Temperance, and Justice...Justice* is, together with *Virtue*, the most important...a female figure is balancing two scale pans suspended by cords... *Knowledge* is above her holding a book in one hand and in the act of balancing a scale. On the plate to the right is an angel... which is giving to two kneeling figures; to one a lance and sword, and to the other, putting money in a box; an another is an angel...cutting off the head of a small kneeling figure while crowning the other.⁷⁴ This denotes vessels of virtue and their corresponding duties to uphold state stability. These duties are not carried out without violence. Instead, to those acts that warrant punishment - for disrupting state peace - *Justice* is achieved with the might of a sword. Similarly, “Enthroned Justice” carefully and consciously integrates the Venetian political schema in the construction of iconhood, sainthood, and sovereignty. This visually layers the human upon the divine and the mystic upon the Pagan. The examination of systems of patronage as they operate within frameworks of biblical and state doctrines serves to clarify the ways in which Venetian art engages in the complex program of its own making.

It was within the Great Chamber Council that verdicts were passed. Moreover, as Alvise Zorzi of *Venice 697-1797: A City, A Republic, An Empire* explains, “The Doge’s Palace, which is the largest municipal building in Venice, was the work of several centuries. At the very heart of the Venetian state, it contained the doge’s private apartments, as well as government offices and the assembly rooms of the collegial magistracies, the most important of which was the *Sala del Maggior Consiglio*. Conference rooms, armories, courtrooms, and even prisons were housed under its roof. It was here that some 100 doges also took the oath of office.”⁷⁵ Thus, the

⁴ Aldo Cairola, *Simone Martini and Ambrogio Lorenzetti in the Town Hall of Siena* (Florence: Istituto Fotocromo Italiano, 1979), 10.

⁵ Alvise Zorzi, *Venice 697-1797: A City, A Republic, An Empire* (Woodstock: The Overlook Press Peter Mayer Publishers, INC, 1999), 46.

patronage of the *Palazzo Ducale* was deeply concerned with delineating categories of the criminal as it is placed in opposition to the just. In his introduction to *Venice: Lion City: The Religion of Empire*, Garry Wills concisely summarizes the intentions of mass patronage to the Venetian state: “In order to celebrate themselves, influential men had to glorify the state by showing themselves in service to it.”⁶ Essentially, “Enthroned Justice” integrates several discourses of power, and this reflects the process and purpose of Venetian patronage.

Theoretical Standpoint

In order to give voice to the complexities of such a process, my research extends from several overlapping fields of inquiry. I draw from the linguistic, cultural, and archaeological sub-fields of anthropology. This reflects the disciplines that I have been trained in as part of my undergraduate studies, and the thinkers who have shaped these disciplines. The German ethnologist Franz Boas, hailed as the father of anthropology, operated from a theoretical standpoint which accepted two positions on the development of culture. This included cultural relativism and historical particularism, concepts both of which recognized the complexity and uniqueness of each culture, as it exists in the modern era and as it has changed over time. This directs my work inward, and lays bare the importance of examining cultural processes on their own terms. Similarly, Edward Sapir, and his student, Benjamin Lee Whorf, contribute to my understanding of how world views are formed and realized. Their groundbreaking theory of linguistic relativity, called the Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis, demonstrates that the structures of language pattern thought, which pattern behavior. This recognizes the universality of the human experience as it is defined by large-scale linguistic patterns. Extending this theory to visual language, the Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis allows for the examination of the ways in which visual language - as an entity encased in a microcosm of thought - produces corresponding habitual behaviors. Finally, Bruce G. Trigger, a prominent archaeologist, devotes much of his work to explaining how the discipline of archaeology itself has produced categories of the marginal and the powerful. This is because

⁶ Gary Wills, *Venice: Lion City: The Religion of Empire* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2001), 21.

methodological systems for understanding the past rely on contemporary ideologies. Not only does this holistic approach tap into the greater implications of such imagery, but the process of completing emically framed research itself recognizes the interconnectedness of place - both core and peripheral - and of identity - both external and internal. This hypothesizes that the ubiquitous power of the state stems from human constructs of authority, knowledge, and management. In this context, the existence of the nation-state denotes the political act of myth-making.

The examination of political imagery, or the visual narrative of proto-nationalist policy, marks the complex dismantling of a strategy overlaid with social, psychological, political, and economic implications. These implications occur as patterns, appearing in both micro - individual-and macro-community-expressions of a mythical experience. The conceptualization of such patterns lends meaning to both the state-commissioned artist (as a social agent) and to the viewer (as a witness), for defining a communicative structure serves to demarcate the institutional roles and responses of its members. While art historians, anthropologists, and archaeologists have analyzed Venice through their respective theoretical lenses, Venice remains sweepingly categorized as operating outside of historical truths, to the extent that it has been placed in opposition to reality itself: "...Venice came to stand for the very idea of the state, an ideal abstraction reified and functioning on earth. It was the rule of law that maintained the serenity of this polity".⁷ Engaging in this network of self-representation is particularly problematic, for it is internally produced and reproduced. Thus, an art historical lens, specifically a holistic and interdisciplinary one, is needed to focus the narrow quality of the visual argon matrix that is Venice. Often, political power and symbolic occupation of a privileged domain combine to legitimize one form of nationhood, placing all other political varieties in opposition to its constructed meaning. Thus, nations mark politically recognized narratives of greatness, domination, and authority. E. Gellner of *Nations and Nationalism*, explains: "Generally speaking, nationalist ideology suffers from pervasive false consciousness. Its myths invert reality: it...claims to protect

⁷ David Rosand, *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 3.

an old folk society while in fact helping to build up an anonymous mass society”.⁸ Drawing from this paradigm allows one to identify systems of appropriation and transformation. Ultimately, this allows for the exploration of both the duality of sacred and profane contexts as seen in the production and function of proto-nationalist discourse and the expression of this through the treatment of such works as Jacobello’s “Enthroned Justice” as a political entity.

Using evidentiary support from the Venetian aesthetic, both local and non-local, political imagery demonstrates that it is not the origin narrative itself but the visual standardization of this narrative—as a political process—that holds social significance for both a sovereign power. In this case, the Doge of Venice, and his citizens, who are made to participate in this system as visually literate subjects, reflect and refract objects of power in their manner of political participation. This means that performative power acts and serves as ritual storytelling. While Venice did not have its beginnings as a full-fledged empire, in the time of the making of “Enthroned Justice Flanked by St. Michael the Archangel and the Angel Gabriel”, Venice maintained meanings external to its respective community, much like a peripheral polity. Thus, in tracing Venetian self-representations and their transmission of political potency, art historical analysis offers dignity to an act that occurs under what its subjects feel to be a profoundly authentic depiction of the Venetian Republic.

Art historian David Rosand upholds this contention in his work, explaining, “That collective image - of the self-proclaimed Most Serene Republic as an ideal political entity whose ruling patriciate were selflessly devoted to the commonwealth - has come to be known as the ‘myth of Venice’... More than a new Rome or a new Constantinople, Venice was a new Jerusalem, a city beloved by God, who caused her to rise from humble mud, resplendent, above the waters, a beacon of Christian liberty”.⁹ Not only does this indicate inherent systems of use and disuse within Venetian discourse, but it also serves as an index of visual units in the production of social meaning. Thus, the concept of specific Venetian imaging as

⁸ Bruce G. Trigger, *A History of Archaeological Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 211.

⁹ David Rosand, *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 3 and 13.

being the “real thing” corresponds with a set of social realities for which Venetian citizens’ political identity is linked. This identity marks the intersection of the mythological and the human, for it is in the ritual context that Venetian self-imaging functions as a political act. Thus, in describing such myth-making iconographically, the symbolic is made scientific, for which a network of rules and regulations trace individual identity within greater spheres of community identity. This appears in the politics of participation, for which visual testimony—and appropriate responses to it—is an object of prestige and power. While a Venetian citizen may produce expressions meaningful to the self and to the personal patriotism, it is the active witness to and exchange of such meaning which is socially powerful and empowering. Essentially, in tracing the complex experience of both the political “architect” and the viewer in Venetian iconography, not only can one better formulate the ways in which visual lore operates within greater frameworks of human communication, but one can also identify the corresponding set of social privileges which imbue performative iconography—and as an extension ritual myth-making—with nationalist purpose and direction.

Essentially, in identifying modes of representation in Venetian contexts, one can identify corresponding modes of meaning. As the embodiment of a nation’s self-consciousness, emblematic imagery can be mapped alongside sociopolitical, sociocultural, and geographical borders. While these borders indicate specific icons’ tie to a social group, icons themselves are far from static, causing constructed border to shift and change across time and space. This means that political imagery has the power to create and re-create social meaning on a continuum of individual productive units (established nation-states are an expression of this phenomenon). It is the analysis of these units which lends greater clarity to contemporary interpretations of Venetian systems of representation and the social implications of such visual communication. Ultimately, in taking a holistic approach informed by the sacred imagery that has become the narrative of Venetian systems of nationhood, sovereignty, citizenship, and worship serve to define Jacobello del Fiore’s “Enthroned Justice Flanked by St. Michael the Archangel and the Angel Gabriel” in its performance of power.

The Context

The physical context of “Enthroned Justice” lends such an image political momentum, for it not only belongs to an important site within Venice’s visual geography, but it marks the complex visual genealogy of Venetian virtue, come to fruition. “Enthroned Justice” is but one manifestation of the overarching Venetian model of self. This extensive and expansive narrative appears perhaps most meaningfully in the greater organization of the *Palazzo Ducale*. The state narrative cycles and their themes are expressed here, through both their careful and operative placement within the *Palazzo Ducale*.

While the birth, life, and glory of Venice occupy the majority of the narrative, the treatment of other symbols is indicative of their sacredness within the Venetian imagery. In particular, the significance of the Virgin Mary as she is embodied by Venetia/ Iustitia, or Venice/ Lady Justice, is made clear through her repeated involvement in the architectural landscape of the *Palazzo Ducale*. In fact, her story is figuratively linked to that of Venice’s through references to the Annunciation, or the message given by the angel Gabriel that Mary will bear Jesus. While this suggests the divine origins of Venice, it also boldly claims the Virgin Mary as a protective force for this valued maritime territory. David Rosand, author of *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State*, argues: “... Venice subtly but aggressively appropriated the image of the Virgin for its own self-representation... To Venetian eyes, such a representation within the political context of its setting would naturally recall the birth of the Republic”.¹⁰ Moreover, because the history of Mary is visually addressed first, the life and times of Jesus—symbolically occupied by the birth of Venice—exists as an extension of Mary’s experience. This intention is made known to the viewer through the placement of several female personifications of Venice as she is projected upon the image of her city patron, the Virgin Mary. Rosand goes on: “The sculptures articulating the surfaces and silhouettes of the Ducal Palace reiterate that theme, which is punctuated by the figures... crowning each of the facades: a personification of Justice over the monumental balcony of the Molo and, crowning the balcony on

¹⁰ David Rosand, *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 13 and 19.

the Piazzetta, a sceptered Venice. Inscriptions and attributions may distinguish these regal women as Iustitia or Venetia, but the public statement unambiguously depends upon their ambivalent resemblance: Venice *is* Justice.”¹¹ Bathed in the light of the setting sun, *Venecia*, located on the west façade of the *Palazzo Ducale*, places the city patron in a position of judgment. However, this figure holds no scales in hand. Instead, she carries out her ruling all the while bearing a imposing sword. This is both admonishing and forewarning. This symbolizes the primary purpose of the *Palazzo Ducale*; to carry out the law of the land in Mary’s honor. Finally, the *Porta della Carta*, or the entrance into the building lays a scene of virtue and triumph. Not only does its placement and complexity indicate its magnitude within the Christian narrative, but it also represents the dichotomy of hell and heaven, and the importance of salvation. *Justice* appears again, this time bearing both a sword and a set of scales. Her nearness to the heavens is marked by her lofty niche. Alcoves below her are occupied by related personifications *Prudence*, *Charity*, *Temperance*, and *Fortitude*.¹² Thus, through painstaking positioning of Venetian narrative scenes, the patrons’ devotion to Mary as well as to her double shadows, Venice and Justice, is made evident. This power center is unyielding in its display of sovereign duty to uphold the Venetian virtues, and this lends a corresponding set of rights—necessary to its own maintenance and survival—to the sovereign powers. These underlying themes not only give greater meaning to the *Palazzo Ducale*, but they also work to unify the many scenes—as visual propaganda—of which it is composed.

Vessels of Vice and Virtue

As part of the reframing of the history of Venice, the active appropriation of ancient symbols by Venetian authorities led to the inseparable quality of Venetian iconography—as it was filtered through the religious state—from that of great antiquity. While this draws heavily from a political tradition of casting “real” objects of power (artifacts and symbols of omnipresent empires) upon genesis stories, the “Myth of Venice” is highly complex in that its origin narrative is not content with a single source of ancestral associa-

¹¹ David Rosand, *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 33.

¹² Luigi Serra, *The Doge’s Palace* (Rome: Istituto Poligr Afico dello Stato, MCMLVI), 7.

tions. Instead, “the Myth of Venice” functions as the convergence of multiple lines of appropriated legacies. [In dismantling this carefully constructed past is to examine the ancient reinterpreted.] This appears perhaps most clearly in the maintenance and morphing of specific vessels of vice and virtue for the purposes of defining the Venetian city-state as a glorious allegory of governmental stability. In his introduction to the transformation of Venice from a humble lagoon territory to *Serenissima*, or “Serenity” on earth, scholar Zorzi explains: “Once upon a time, Venice was nothing but a deserted swamp...an uninhabited outback...” These words, spoken by Byzantine emperor Constantine Porphyrogenitus, exemplify to what extent the story of the birth of the city that would one day become a great metropolis at the crossroads of East and West has taken on mythical proportions.”¹³ This speaks to the use of bestiary templates and warrior gods and their symbols as a means of visually encoding the Venetian past with triumphal power.

In his well-received book, *Allegories of the Virtues and Vices in Medieval Art: From Early Christian Time to the Thirteenth Century*, Adolf Katzenellenbogen cites the appearance and reappearance of specific virtues and vices across the European continent as operating within a greater framework of monumentalized images of good versus evil as conceived by the state system. He identifies the religious site as historically conducive to producing and propagating such politically-charged images: “The triumphal motive is also applied to holy figures, which likewise stand upon the children of darkness, as in a *Vitae Sanctorum* manuscript of the Cîteaux School of about 1115, where saints are portrayed standing upon a helplessly cringing naked figure, a winged devil or a dragon. In other instances the triumph of the virtues is paralleled by the triumph of virtuous women. In miniature of the *Speculum Virginum*, ascribed to Conrad of Hirsau (cira 1070- circa 1150), Humilitas thrusts a sword into the breast of the fallen Superbia and on one side Jael stands on the corpse of Sisera, whose head she has pierced with a nail, while the other, as a further example of the victor of humility, Judith treads upon the slain Holofernes.”¹⁴ Not only does this

¹³ Alvise Zorzi, *Venice 697-1797: A City, A Republic, An Empire* (Woodstock: The Overlook Press Peter Mayer Publishers, INC, 1999), 14.

¹⁴ Adolf Katzenellenbogen, *Allegories of the virtues and vices in medieval art: from early Christian time to the thirteenth century* (Toronto:

recognizes the sacredness of vessels of virtue, but it also points to the multiplicity of vessels of virtue as they appear in human terms. The embodiment of the highest virtues by women is particularly interesting, for it suggest archetypal city-goddess figures as patrons and protectors of whole peoples and pasts. Katzenellenbogen goes on to discuss the standardization of these figures being powerfully tied to conceptions of statehood and corresponding systems of rulership: “The artists of the Latin West, however, did not grow weary of portraying again and again groups of virtues within firmly established framework; western thought indeed displayed particular interest in the systemization of ethics...It was the clear, fundamentally classical system of the four cardinal virtues (Prudentia, Justitia, Temperantia, Fortitudo) which they added to the portrayals of notable personages, especially of rulers.”¹⁵ This parallels the ways in which “Enthroned Justice” engages in larger systems of visual lore in order to demonstrate its particular concern with upholding civic virtue.

This process of installing an image for viewership produces corresponding modes of viewership, symbolically steeping public images ever deeper in state doctrine. This serves to interact with the greater Venetian discourse, employing specific visual devices for the purpose of codifying sovereign rule as a repository of divine authority. Rosand contends: “In imagining her own figure, the Republic of Venice identified her personified self with the virtue of Justice.”¹⁶ Although an obscure image within art historical documentation, Jacobello’s “Enthroned Justice” quietly speaks to the subtle, yet pervasive nature of a carefully constructed narrative. This is evidenced by the commission and patronage of public art and architecture which extend the act of nation-building to the political feat of empire-building. “Enthroned Justice” intertwines the saga of Venice’s hallowed makings with Byzantine aesthetic, as it has been hemmed and tailored to Italy’s lagoons. On a finely embellished triptych, three figures emerge from a dusky black background. These ambiguous surroundings do not deny these figures potency. Instead, it allows all three figures to powerfully occupy

University of Toronto Press, 1989), 15-16.

¹⁵ Ibid., 30.

¹⁶ David Rosand, *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 26.

their assigned space. To the left, towers Archangel Michael, to the far right, Archangel Gabriel. The center panel, the largest of the three, displays Lady Justice, seated, yet not impassive—she is the only figure who gazes outward, suggestively considering her audience. It is on a throne from which Justice appears actively assessing, weighing, measuring, and ultimately passing judgment. The process is laid bare to the viewer, allowing one to access to the transparency of such a decision. This program visually linked actual judges of Venice to those divine figures selected to uphold the image of Venetian statehood. This is linked to Katzenellenbogen’s analysis of objects related to and imbued with meanings of virtue, as they are simultaneously voided of connotations of vice. While Katzenellenbogen uses early French material as his primary data, his interpretation of the “cardinal virtues” mark greater intersections of court, domestic, and religious spheres within governmental domains. This applies to the Venetian city-state. Katzenellenbogen contends “The pedestals of crosses frequently bear medallions with representations of the cardinal virtues... And so, in order that they may convey a special meaning beyond that of their actual practical purpose, many things are finally imbued with moral significance—chalices, patens, aquamaniles, liturgical bowls, crowns, doors, chandeliers, and tombs.”¹⁷ In the case of “Enthroned Justice”, the crown of Justice takes on several connotations of morality. While “Enthroned Justice” appears as *Justitia*, the symbolic layering of her person suggests related identities. This includes the Virgin Mary as she is superimposed upon the role of pre-Christian city-goddess. The overlay of the one female personification of protection and virtue upon the other is heightened by the enthronement of this figure. Moreover, the crown that appears atop her head holds powerful connotations—not mere traces of—divine authority. This is because the presence of a crown implies a corresponding act of coronation. Thus, the sovereign power—embodied by Lady Justice/ the Virgin Mary/ city-goddess—is made *Serenissima*. She maintains the stability of the city-state through objective acts of punishment and mercy. Furthermore, she has been granted the right to do so, just as the Virgin Mary was granted the title of divine royalty.

¹⁷ Adolf Katzenellenbogen, *Allegories of the virtues and vices in medieval art: from early Christian time to the thirteenth century* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1989), 49-51.

The double power of occupying religious and political echelons of authority reinforce the visual knowledge of good and evil as it is projected by “Enthroned Justice”.

These associations of good and evil, as they are upheld by trusted state figures, is also relevant to the animal figures that appear in “Enthroned Justice”. Katzenellenbogen identifies certain animals as popular vessels of vice and virtue: “Thus certain animals are ascribed to virtues...as distinguishing characteristics in the same way as they were associated with the gods of classical mythology.”¹⁸ In upholding this tradition, Venetian templates for animals of virtue and vice both maintain linkages with the deep past and preserve established standards for vessels of good versus evil. One prevailing symbol is that of the lion, two of which flank the throne of Lady Justice in Jacobello’s triptych. Across time and space, the lion has emerged as a symbol of kingship and security. Rosand explains: “As the Republic expanded its empire, eastward, along the Adriatic shore and into the Aegean and the westward into the Italian terra firma, well into Lombardy, the winged lion followed, its presence, in relief or sculpted in the round, declared Venetian dominion.”¹⁹ This is echoed in the message of the scroll that it suspended over the throne of Lady Justice. This scroll also suggestively encompasses the space above Lady Justice’s lion companions. It reads: “I will carry out the admonition of the angels and the holy word: gentle with the pious, harsh with the evil, and haughty with the proud.”²⁰ In addition to delineating who raises Lady Justice’s scales of judgment to salvation and who lowers the scales to damnation, this scroll’s reference to carrying out the will of the angels is particularly significant. In E.P Evans’ *Animal Symbolism in Ecclesiastical Architecture*, he describes the lion symbol as espousing “spiritual vigilance”. He contends that with the Christian era, the lion has emerged as a sign of the Resurrection: “Like the savior, lion is of the tribe of Judah, concealed all of his traces of his godhead when he descended to earth and entered the womb of Mary, the lion always sleeps with eyes open—so Christ slept with his body on the

18 Ibid., 60.

19 David Rosand, *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 48.

20 Keith Christiansen, *Jacobello del Fiore* (Oxford University Press 2007-2011), 2.

cross, thirdly the lioness brings forth her whelps dead and watches over them for three days, when on the third day, will rise to eternal life.”²¹ This spiritual vigilance rewards those who claim the lion as protection. Evans continues: “At some later period the lion, as a symbol of Resurrection, was sculpted on public building of secular character and on private dwellings; it was also engraved on pieces of armour and especially on helmets, with the legend ‘*domine vivifica me secundum verbum tuum*’, or some other device, expressive of the hope that the warrior, if slain in battle, might be raised up on the last day.”²² Thus, to flank Lady Justice with the victorious lion is to imbue her allegorical meaning with further and deeper modes of virtue. Then, to acknowledge her as a protectress is to guard oneself against vices of the devil. This not only ensures one’s own state of virtue, but also grants one a place in the heavens for such virtue. This display of salvation by way of virtuous animal, has roots in an ancient text, called the *Physiologus*. Rudolph Wittkower, author of *Allegory and the Migration of Symbols*, explains the pervasiveness of this text within the Medieval mind: “Another road of transmission of Egyptian material was due to the *Physiologus*. Many traditions, Greek, oriental, native Egyptian, were united here...E.P Evans, the author of a work on animal symbolism, rightly says that ‘perhaps no book except the Bible has ever been so widely diffused among so many people and for so many centuries as the *Physiologus*.’ It was translated in every conceivable language...and from the 12th century onward it got a new lease of life through the bestiaries, the repositories of medieval zoological knowledge”²³ Thus, *Physiologus* served as a valuable didactic tool, for it defined Christian morality and its agents of good and evil. These lessons simultaneously remind its audience of the rewards of the virtuous and the punishments awaiting the disobedient. “Enthroned Justice” carries out such rulings of salvation and damnation by way of the city-state structure of enforcement.

21 E.P Evans, *Animal Symbolism in Ecclesiastical Architecture*, chapter 3

22 *Ibid.*, chapter 3

23 Rudolph Wittkower, *Allegory and the Migration of Symbols* (New York: Thames and Hudson, 1987), 114-115.

Visual Empire- Building

Archangel Michael holds particular archetypal resonance for Venice. This warrior figure, a powerful repository of Venetian valor, maintains links with much earlier figures of martyrdom. This includes St. Mark, the patron saint of Venice, adopted from the ancient Greek saint, St. Theodore Stratelates of Heraclea. Rosand clarifies the common confusion surrounding the position of St. Mark within the Venetian saga of saintly benefaction: “Such divine preordination notwithstanding, Mark was not in fact the original patron saint of the early Venetians. That distinction went to Theodore, a Greek warrior saint, whose patronage effectively attested Venetian status as a province of the Byzantine empire, under the immediate command of the exarchate of Ravenna.”²⁴ This old line of patronage is archaeologically visible. Monuments to the Greek warrior saint and his greater associations of the Byzantium appear in the material culture of Venetian public spaces. Rosand goes on: “At the public entrance to the city, in the Piazzetta facing the *bacino*, two massive granite columns, trophies of the east, were erected in 1172. Atop one is a bronze lion: a chimera of antique oriental origin, transformed by the addition of wings into a lion of St. Mark—creating the columnar leonine model that was to be replicated in the public squares of many towns of the later empire. Crowning the other column is a composite figure, made up of pieces ancient and modern: a warrior triumphant over a dragon, haloed to represent St. Theodore. Pious Venice did not forget its first protector.”²⁵ This public monument marks a continuance in the recognition of and reverence for ancient protectors of the city-state. St. Theodore is hailed as an ancestor of the particular form of Venetian justice, for he first guarded the city-state from misrule and attack by way of vice. Scholar Wills, of *Venice: Lion City: The Religion of Empire*, cites another public site which demonstrates the symbolic union between St. Mark and his predecessor, St. Theodore: “When Theodore is not paired with Saint George, as the twin warriors of the city in peril, he complements Saint Mark, suggesting the city’s Byzantine past and its continuity with the ‘new saint of

²⁴ David Rosand, *Myths of Venice: The Figuration of a State* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 53.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 55

the town.’ They appear together for example, on the Rialto Bridge. It has already been noticed that those approaching the bridge from one side see the angel of the Annunciation and Mary on the aprons of the bridge. Those coming from the other direction see, on one apron, Theodore seated in his armor and holding his spear, while on the other Mark is seated with his lion and his gospel.”²⁶ Not only does this form a visual link between those honored members of the Venetian state and the virtues that it seeks to uphold, but it also demonstrates the intricately woven narrative which its visually literate citizens are instructed in continually and thoroughly. This appears very expressively and explicitly in the series of mosaics in the *San Marco*, or St. Mark’s Basilica. Wills explains the significance of visually upholding the obligation the Doge—as an extension of his subjects—had in abiding by the symbolic clout of its chosen warrior saints: “The doge’s very office now depended on his relation to the relic of Mark. He assumed his responsibility by signing a Pledge (*Promissione*) that was, in effect a contract with Mark. Speaking for the whole Venetian people, he bound himself to defend Mark’s relic in return for Mark’s protection of the city. This contract brought Venice many advantages. By welcoming a Western saint, Venice not only edged itself away from Byzantium but from the parts of its own past that had been formed in the Byzantine ethos—a cultural dependence expressed by its prior choice of an official patron, the Eastern martyr Saint Theodore, whose relics had been kept in the doge’s chapel before it became Mark’s resting place.”²⁷ This means that the doge and his office, along with his related officials became an extension of the warrior position. This was adopted from the duties and rights of the warrior saints. Thus, the doge took on a mimetic relationship with Venetian patron saints as a means of harnessing and being entrusted with the good will of the people. This was visually conveyed through the specific function of *San Marco*. Wills continues: “The doge’s chapel was rebuilt, expanded, sheathed in the precious spoils from imperia campaigns fought in Mark’s name, under Mark’s flag. The doge was assisted in his guardianship of the basilica and its surroundings by Venice’s

²⁶ Gary Wills, *Venice: Lion City: The Religion of Empire* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2001), 259.

²⁷ Gary Wills, *Venice: Lion City: The Religion of Empire* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2001), 30-31.

‘Caretakers’ (*Procuratori*), who thus became very high officials. In and around and throughout the doge’s basilica, Mark’s story is told and retold and referred to in painted and jeweled and sculpted artifacts. San Marco is, in effect, one large reliquary, a huge casket to hold the treasure of Mark’s body. It has already been mentioned that the doge himself could not be represented in his own church except in his role as keeper of Mark’s body.”²⁸ Thus, the allegories of the state are reflected in strategic visual placement, treatment, and regulation of the patron saints’ narrative (old and new). This seeks to transform mythical roots into real power as it corresponds with a tangible Venetian identity. Essentially, narratives of the Venetian state define and unify a people via visual literacy. Ultimately, these figures (St. Theodore, St. Michael, St. Mark, ect.) display the unbroken line of selected Venetian heritages.

Conclusion

Essentially, in tracing the complex experience of both the political “architect” and the viewer in Venetian iconography, not only can one better formulate the ways in which visual lore operates within greater frameworks of human communication, but one can also identify the corresponding set of social privileges which imbue performative iconography—and as an extension ritual myth-making—with proto- nationalist purpose and direction. Furthermore, in identifying modes of representation in Venetian contexts, one can identify corresponding modes of meaning. As the embodiment of a nation’s self- consciousness, allegorical imagery can be mapped alongside sociopolitical, sociocultural, and geographical borders.

While these borders indicate specific icons’ ties to a social group, icons themselves are far from static, causing their own borders to shift and change across time and space. This means that political imagery has the power to create and re-create social meaning on a continuum of individual productive units (established nation-states are an expression of this phenomenon). It is the analysis of these units which lends greater clarity to contemporary interpretations of Venetian systems of representation and the social implications of such visual communication. Ultimately, in taking a holistic ap-

28 *Ibid.*, 31.

proach informed by the sacred imagery that has become the narrative of Venetian systems of nationhood; sovereignty, citizenship, and worship serve to define Jacobello del Fiore's "Enthroned Justice". In its performance of power, "Enthroned Justice" serves as a haunting reminder of the archetypal seeds needed to plant institutions of statehood and rule.

Propaganda and Journalism in America: Creel, Lippmann, and Bernays as Critics and Innovators

Abstract: Propaganda has been an effective tool for governments for centuries. But, during World War I, the American government began developing propaganda with a scientific expertise unseen prior to that time. As a result, propaganda became a key component of governmental communications, both internal and external. This paper will examine the development of propaganda as a scientific discipline during and after World War I. Further, it will consider the roles of the key players in its development, George Creel, Walter Lippmann, and Edward Bernays. Each man played a unique role in the development and use of propaganda at the time. And, as a group, they can truly be viewed as the founding intelligence behind American propaganda as we know it today. Finally, we will consider the role of propaganda in American democracy and its effect on the press.

Keywords: Propaganda studies, George Creel, Walter Lippmann, Edward Bernays, World War I

The relationship between the American press and the American government changed dramatically during the era of the World Wars, 1920 through 1945. The tools and techniques of propaganda begun during World War I were adapted for peacetime as a method to influence the political public. Three men were instrumental in crafting the principles of democratic governance and the governmental communication from World War I through World War II: George Creel, Walter Lippmann, and Edward Bernays. By telling the stories of these men, we can better understand propaganda and the changing nature of the American press.

Creel, Lippmann, and Bernays significantly impacted the philosophy and execution of public communication as it grew from

World War I to World War II. Woodrow Wilson selected Creel to head the Committee on Public Information (CPI). Sharrett (2004) noted that, “the Creel Committee grew in part out of the “engineering of consent” ethos that . . . advocated persuasion and manipulation of public mind over the brute force common of the era of robber barons” (pp. 127-128). Lippmann and Bernays were Creel’s advisers. Lippmann, “viewed the social sciences as instrumental in controlling a public that he saw as bewildered, prejudiced, and unable to see its best interests - which in Lippmann’s view were synonymous with state and private concerns” (Ibid., 127-128). These men provided the foundation for U.S. governmental ‘information’ – or propaganda.

Initially, it is important to understand exactly what propaganda is and does. Definitions of propaganda are varied and have been a troubling paradox over the years. But recently, the definition seems to have settled on the negative connotation even though that wasn’t its original derivation. Haavard Koppang noted that propaganda was not initially a negative term. Koppang (2009) explained, “The English derivative ‘propagation’ originally meant simply an extension in time and space” (p. 117). In a 2004 introduction to the seminal Bernays work, *Propaganda*, Mark Crispin Miller noted that, “(p)rior to the war [World War I], the word’s derogatory use was far less common than its neutral denotation” (p. 11). Propaganda was a word without connotation.

Yet today, clearly, the negative connotation has won out. Koppang (2009) suggested that propaganda is “organized mass communication, derived from a hidden agenda on mission to conform belief and action by manipulating mechanisms - drawn from a hidden agenda on instrumentality - to circumvent individual reasoning and rational choice” (p. 220). Koppang’s definition outlines the propagandist tenets of manipulation, hidden agendas, and conformity of belief and action that have dominated the study of propaganda since World War I. But, this definition flies in the face of the ‘father’ of public relations, Edward Bernays, who applied the precepts and techniques of his uncle, Sigmund Freud, to the political and commercial world of the late 1920s. Koppang (2009) also noted that Bernays, a member of CPI, is viewed as “the architect of modern propaganda” because of his 1928 work, *Propaganda* (p. 118). He

further explained, “Bernays tried to promote his ‘gospel of propaganda as massmediated democracy’s last best hope’ - a version of propaganda for democracy” (ibid, p. 118). But, it is also clear that Bernays’ work inspired other propagandists such as Goebbels, the master of Nazi Germany’s communications (ibid, p. 118). The term developed such a negative connotation post World War I that it has stuck in the public’s mind even today. The success of the efforts by practitioners such as Goebbels before and during World War II further strengthened the negativity of the word in spite of Bernays’ best efforts to turn its meaning into some form of positive power in a democracy.

It is also important to understand the development in the psychology and techniques of news reporting during World War I. Robert Park (1923) noted that the fundamental nature of newspapers as political organs developed early in American history when the newspaper took on the role of opinion maker thus superseding the political pamphlet. Editorial articles became the ‘broadside’ of the pamphlets. And, “the editorial writer, who had inherited the mantle of the pamphleteer, now assumed the role of a tribune of the people” (Park, 1923, p. 281). America was also very isolationist at the time. Neil MacNeil described a very inwardly focused America with no interest in its place in global politics prior to World War I. MacNeil (1947) noted that before World War I, “American editors, like the American people, were concerned almost exclusively with American news.” (p. 246).

As World War I began, reporting techniques had to adapt to a new type of global war. Farish notes that early in WWI, the technological mechanisms used by reporters from the “European” war were significantly debilitated. He further notes that between July 28th and August 6th, 1914, communication systems such as the postal service, telephone, and telegraph services were interrupted. Additionally, land and sea traffic were also stopped. He concludes, “The inhuman landscapes of electronic communication and capitalism - those relentless circuits of speed and power that, for Kern, produced such simultaneity - were also interrupted, segregated, and appropriated by various orders of government” (Farish, 2001, p. 277). The mechanics of international reporting were handcuffed forcing reporters and their editors to adapt.

Farish continues by describing the ‘new normal’ of a war fought across a broad geography with numerous “fronts”, disparate “lines”, and confusing topography with severe censorship between the field reporter and his newspaper. Reporters were “circumscribed by saturating censorship and massive, confusing battlefields which frequently denied observers an overall view” (Farish, 2001, p. 283). In 1920, a censor named Lyton noted that the Western front “ended solitary, enterprising journalism” (ibid, p. 281). The new realities of war forced a new process of reporting the news.

And, as the war began, technology also began to change the mechanisms for reporting the news. Reporters and now photographers were granted the opportunity to present written and photographic evidence of the intricacies of this new world war. The innovation of the half-tone block enabled newspapers to include pictures with reports. As a result, photographers were subjected to the same scrutiny as journalists, often unable to get shots of the “desired perspective” (Farish, 2001, p. 279). Opportunities for editorial manipulation appeared more often.

It is in this context that George Creel entered the scene as head of the Committee of Public Information (CPI), the governmentally empowered committee charged with building a propaganda machine in the United States. Creel was a well-known liberal newsman, a strong supporter of President Wilson, and clearly someone willing to take on the role as the chief advocate for government communications. Eight days after the United States entered World War I, Wilson established the CPI. Eventually, the CPI became known as the Creel Committee, a reflection of Creel’s perceived importance and vision. In his role as the visionary and voice of the CPI, Creel outlined his approach to propaganda to a democratic society in his 1918 essay, “Public Opinion in War Time.” Particularly sensitive to the role of propaganda in a free society, he noted, “We are trying to ‘sell’ America to the world. We have been the most provincial people that ever lived, the most self-satisfied people; we have always been sufficient unto ourselves, and the very fact that other people did not speak our language was accepted at once as a proof of inferiority” (Creel, 1918, p. 189). Further, in the same essay, he advocated for the use of propaganda given its foundation in science, “The fight for it is part of the military program of every

country, for every belligerent nation has brought psychology to the aid of science” (ibid, p. 185). Creel’s vision crafted the CPI and, with an influx of governmental resources, provided the foundation for all its efforts.

From a newspaper’s perspective, the introduction of formalized propaganda by sovereign nations made the reporter’s job significantly more complex and subtle. When defending the key American organization that developed U.S. propaganda for WWI, Creel described the critical difference between the sovereign public propaganda organizations and the Committee when he noted, “Always it was our policy to find out what the German propagandists were doing, and then we did not do it. People have an instinct for the truth, and while falsehood and trickery may win for a while, detection and reaction are inevitable in the end” (Creel, 1941, p. 346). He emphasized truth as one of the critical tenets of American propaganda, what he believed to be the antithesis to the German effort.

It is in this context that propaganda in the United States developed and flourished, the context of a seemingly overwhelming ‘world war’ with limited technology, dispersed fronts, traditions of political newspapers, and isolationist Americans. Farish (2001) indicates that “it was through newspapers that ‘civilians’ fantastic relation to the war was mobilized - and to some extent produced” (p. 282). Journalists played a role in creating a “myth of the war”, which represented a limited perspective and an “imaginative version of reality rather than its falsification” (ibid, p. 282). The relationship between the press and the governmental propaganda machine created a strong incentive for a collective vision, Farish’s imaginative version of reality.

The global nature of the War, the changing newspaper environment, America’s forced denial of isolationism, and the active use of propaganda during the War created a seminal cauldron for the redeployment of propaganda in peacetime America. The “scientific employment” of propaganda in government occurred during the twentieth century. It was used during and after World War I (Taylor, 1980, p. 486). And, it was used on the United States public prior to the American commitment to the war. MacNeil observes that the Allies and Central Powers utilized propaganda to garner American support for the war citing a September 9th, 1914 issue of the New

York Times which called World War I a “press agent war.” He further notes, “The British struck a powerful blow at the Germans when they cut the cables from Germany to America. This left only the carefully censored English cables to relay news to the United States, for the wireless was still young and inadequate” (MacNeil, 1947, p. 250). Propaganda dominated the news of the time, propaganda from within and without.

As the end of World War I neared, even governmental messages not intended to be propaganda served the purpose of propaganda. The line between America’s global political messages and propaganda was even blurrier. Lutz (1933) noted that on January 8th, 1918, President Wilson delivered his Fourteen Points to both houses of Congress, outlining U.S. goals in the war. He concludes, “The propagandist effect of this peace proposal exceeded all expectations” (Lutz, 1933, p. 514). The political message and American propaganda became one.

Edward Bernays and Walter Lippmann served as advisors to George Creel and the CPI during World War I. As a result, their ‘stamp’ shows up throughout the work of the CPI. And, as the world of public information morphed into a scientific discipline during WWI, both Bernays and Lippmann rose to prominence. Given the fundamental changes that occurred during WWI, it is not surprising that news reporting and propaganda changed after WWI. The perfect storm of WWI created an environment ripe for such change. In retrospect, the movement towards globalization had a major effect on news reporting organizations in America as well. During the 1920s, as Americans attempted to focus more on international news, it was not possible to return to the “old news formulas” (MacNeil, 1947, pp. 254-255). During the 1920’s and 1930’s, innovative technology such as radios, cars, and aircraft, in tandem with telephones and telegraphs changed the lives and thinking of Americans. “All these [modern technologies] served also to make the world smaller and to destroy American isolationism” (ibid, p. 256). Post World War I America was a very different place – and a very different news environment.

Edward Bernays, in his 1928 seminal work, *Propaganda*, exposed the psychological and sociological techniques developed during the Great War. He noted that propaganda greatly influences

individuals' viewpoints on world events. Reading a newspaper illustrates the power that propaganda has over people. Bernays (1928) goes on to observe that, "page one of the New York Times on the day these paragraphs are written contains eight important news stories. Four of them or one-half are propaganda" (p. 23). He documented the proliferation and changing nature of propaganda, a social force which he helped develop.

In *Propoganda*, Bernays discusses the pervasiveness of propaganda in the post-World War I newspapers. Relying on broad, neutral definitions in *Funk & Wagnall's Dictionary* and the *Standard Dictionary*, he defines propaganda as almost every type of information released by the government and printed by newspapers. Viewed as the Father of Public Relations, Bernays defines his way into the new world of public information and persuasion by attaching the propaganda label to most 'persuasive' governmentally and commercially released information of the time. Yet, recognizing his association with the wartime Committee on Public Information and Walter Lippmann, Bernays created a theory of peacetime persuasion. He noted, "Modern propaganda is a consistent, enduring effort to create or shape events to influence the relations of the public to an enterprise, idea, or group" (Bernays, 1928, p. 25). Propaganda sought respect in the words of Bernays and the science of propaganda, as developed by the CPI, produced that desired aura of respectability.

Bernays became a leading advocate of the judicious use of propaganda for "public persuasion." He developed the concept of the psychology of public persuasion. Using this idea, he could sway public opinion towards "new doctrines, beliefs, and habits" (Bernays, 1928, p. 959). Thus, many of the governmental and commercial communication activities that we see today are a direct result of Bernays' work. The manipulation of public thought underlies virtually every message that we see today whether governmental or commercial. Prior to Bernays, this concept did not exist.

As a result of the 'evils' of propaganda during World War I and the realization that newspapers were not necessarily the agents of fact, the American public became very skeptical of propaganda and its relationship to the news. But, the American public was naïve during the wave of anti-propaganda during the 1920's and 1930's.

Riegel (1935) notes that newspapers contain signaled articles. An article can't simply be factual without opinion. The act of selecting which articles to print "implies a standard of values regarding public events that is in essence political" (Riegel, 1935, p. 206). Indeed, in 1935, Riegel noted that the anti-propaganda movement tended to see propaganda in every nook and cranny of the American commercial and political world (and consequently, the news world). He noted, "Indeed, there is some danger of an epidemic of a new nervous malady, propaganditis, which might be diagnosed as a paranoiac hallucination of the citizen that the whole world is conspiring to put something over on him" (ibid, p. 201). Clearly, this was an overreaction to the 'evils' of propaganda.

Filters are critical components of the propaganda model as presented by Bernays. Edward S. Herman and Noam Chomsky describe the various ways news is filtered. They observe that propaganda systems are harder to notice in countries without censorship. Within media organizations, there is tight control on access to resources. They further note that a propaganda model "traces the route by which money and power are able to filter out the news fit to print, marginalize dissent, and allow the government and dominant private interests to get their messages across to the public" (Herman and Chomsky, 1988/1999, p. 166). The filters are the key to propagandist control and in a democracy, such filters are sometimes subtle and less obvious than similar mechanisms in totalitarian states. "Propaganditis" reflected a fear of such filters.

As a result of the anti-propaganda movement during the late 1920's and 1930's and a general skepticism of the press, news reporters and editors found that their editorial feet were being held to the propaganda fire. Casey (1942) notes, "Every journalist now recognizes that he is confronted with a problem of first magnitude in the unthinking failure of sections of the public to distinguish between propaganda, which is the deliberate and conscious effort to fix an attitude or modify an opinion as it relates to a doctrine or program, and, on the other hand, the conscientious effort of the agencies of communication to disseminate facts in a spirit of objectivity and honesty" (pp. 66-67). Skepticism of the press serves as the propaganda antidote in a democratic society where the mechanisms are less obvious. And, the American public's attitude at the time

continued to reflect a naivete regarding objectivity and the press.

Adding further complexity to the American public's perception of propaganda was the developing 'science' of propaganda analysis. Initially, propaganda analysts examined the structural components of alleged propaganda as if they were codes to be broken. But, it soon became apparent that the words and their grammar were nowhere near as powerful as the context surrounding those words. Garber (1942) notes, "No value judgments are here admitted, no analysis of meaning in the sense that we all understand it; the problem of truth or falsity is excluded" (p. 241). The attempts to create a grammatical science of propaganda analysis missed the proverbial forest for the trees and stoked America's fears.

The seeming presence of propaganda 'everywhere' politically and commercially after WWI preceded by a war experience in which propaganda actually was pervasive and sometimes indistinguishable in the news created a social environment in which the government, the press, and commercial interests were viewed skeptically by the American public. This skepticism and cynicism was directed at the press as the country moved away from the War. In combination with powerful consolidating business interests in the ownership of dailies, this skepticism fueled the mistrust of the press. Awareness of interests both business and political and their effect on news reporting heightened during the era. And, it is perhaps for good reason that Americans viewed their news more cautiously. Naïve definitions of objectivity in the press waivered. The truth of the subjectivity of the objective press became much more apparent.

Facts are the basis of news reporting. Schudson (1978/1999) notes that at the start of the twentieth century, journalists rarely separated facts from values. Prior to World War I, journalists were interested in presenting the facts. These journalists "believed that facts are not human statements about the world but aspects of the world itself" (Schudson, 1978/1999, p. 293). During the 1920s and 1930s, journalists started to question the facts. Reporters started to categorize reports into columns such as the political column and to meet standards of objectivity (Schudson, 1978, pp. 293-294). Thus, objectivity was a developing standard – and a moving target.

The third member of the influential propagandist team, Walter Lippmann, was viewed as one of the key intellectuals of his time and a respected journalist. He began his career in the CPI and was, in many ways, just as responsible as Creel and Bernays for the development of propaganda and the governmental machine that made it work. Goodwin (1995) noted that Lippmann always pondered the question, “what is the proper role for the intellectual, and for the social scientist in particular, in the policy process?” (p. 317). Sharrett (2004) noted that Lippmann saw the social sciences as “instrumental in controlling a public that he saw as bewildered, prejudiced, and unable to see its best interests - which in Lippmann’s view were synonymous with state and private concerns” (p. 127). Lippmann provided an intellectual’s perspective into the world of the CPI and propaganda. But, his perspective also contained undertones of elitism.

During the Great War, Lippmann seems to have lost his faith in the general ‘public’. His view that the public was easily manipulated and swayed by propaganda, not the intellectual thinkers of the time, caused him great distress and made him rethink his view of incorporating the public’s opinion into policy. During the war, the public was subjected to “poor news reporting, and by propaganda, manipulation, and distortion perpetuated by its own government” (Goodwin, 1995, p. 326). Goodwin concludes that Lippmann noted that “from this experience with censorship, misinformation, and disinformation was that the conception of widespread public understanding of and participation in public policy could be merely a dangerous and sentimental dream” (ibid). Lippmann’s informational elitism was supported, in his eyes, by his view that the process of news reporting and policy analysis could be tainted when viewed by the naïve public. This ‘taint’ could lead to invalid conclusions as the public was swayed by misinformation, invalid conclusions that could provoke faulty policy decisions.

Lippmann’s experience at the CPI haunted him for the remainder of his career as a policy analyst and advisor. Shortly after the dissolution of the CPI, he noted, “The art of befuddlement engages able men and draws appropriations. There are in practically all countries Ministries of Befuddlement generally presided over by personal representatives of the leading statesmen” (Eulau, 1954, p.

101). As a result, Lippmann appeared to use his CPI experience as the basis for his critical thought for years to come. He became a leading critic of the results of the CPI.

Creel, Bernays and Lippmann founded the American propagandist machine. But, propaganda, as conceived and developed by them, implies a unified governmental and societal view of ‘what’s right for the country.’ It implies that the message of what is politically correct, the message of the propagandist, is good for all. Yet, the propagandist views of Creel, Bernays, and Lippmann also imply that the vast majority of the country’s population has no idea what is good and right for it. Each contributor to the early science of propaganda seemed to feel that they knew what was best for the country. Only Lippmann proved to be more critical after his CPI experience.

Propaganda evoked (and still evokes) skepticism in the American public. As Bernays and Creel noted, the identification of propaganda and skepticism of its meaning were certainly a positive development for the previously naïve and isolationist America. Skepticism of any political system drives political freedom. When the freedoms tend to dissolve in times of crisis, it is important to remain skeptical and questioning. Given the pressures on the press, both political and commercial, the ‘educated’ reader is the best antidote to hidden agendas and propaganda. Only when contrary opinions and views are prevented will a democracy implode under the weight of a single perspective. Thus, given the continuing Constitutional protections in America, the development of public skepticism that arose post World War I has provided the basis for our continuing adversarial system in which ideas are criticized and tested. Hopefully, in spite of the manipulations of various special interests, both government and commercial, the American public will retain its skepticism and not follow a single leader or idea into tyrannical abyss. Creel, Bernays and Lippmann created the machine. Its proper use lies with future generations.

Bibliography

- Bernays, E. L. (May, 1928). Manipulating Public Opinion: The Why and The How. *The American Journal of Sociology* 33(6). Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2765989>.
- Bernays, E.L. (1928/2005). Propaganda. New York: H. Liveright. Casey, R.D. (Jan., 1942). The Press, Propaganda, and Pressure Groups. *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 219. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1023894>.
- Cornwell, E.E. (Summer, 1959). Wilson, Creel and the Presidency. *The Public Opinion Quarterly* 23(2), 189-202. Oxford University Press. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2746620>.
- Creel, G. (Nov., 1941). Propaganda and Morale. *The American Journal of Sociology*, 47(3), 340-351. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2769284>.
- Creel, G. (Jul., 1918). Public Opinion in War Time. *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 78, 185-194. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1014269>.
- Eulau, H. (Spring, 1954). Wilsonian Idealist: Walter Lippmann Goes to War. *The Antioch Review* 14(1), 87-108. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4609697>.
- Farish, M. (2001). Modern Witnesses: Foreign Correspondents, Geopolitical Vision, and the First World War. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, New Series* 26(3). Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3650646>.
- Garber, W. (Sep., 1942). Propaganda Analysis – To What Ends? *The American Journal of Sociology* 48(2), 240- 245. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2769619>.
- Goodwin, C.D. (Nov., 1995). The Promise of Expertise: Walter Lippmann and the Policy Sciences. *Policy Sciences* 28(4), 317-345. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4532358>.

- Herman E.S. & Chomsky, N. (1988/1999). Manufacturing Consent. In H. Tumber (Ed.), *News: A Reader* (pp. 50,58). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Koppang, H. (Summer 2009). Social Influence by Manipulation: A Definition and Case of Propaganda. *Middle East Critique* 18 (2). Retrieved from: EBSCO Host.
- Lutz, R.H. (Dec., 1933). Studies of World War Propaganda, 1914-33. The *Journal of Modern History* 5(4), 496-516. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1872083>.
- Lippmann, W. (1922/2007). The Nature of the News. In *Public Opinion* (106-113). United States: B.N. Publishing.
- MacNeil, N. (Jan., 1947). American Newspapers through Two World Wars. *American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 6(2), 245-260. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3483805>.
- Park, Robert E. (Nov., 1923). The Natural History of the Newspaper. The *American Journal of Sociology* 29(3), 273-289. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2764232>.
- Riegel, O. W. (May, 1935). "Propaganda and the Press." *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 179, Pressure Groups and Propaganda, 201-210. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1020297>.
- Schudson, M. (1978/1999). Discovering the News: A Social History of American Newspapers. In H. Tumber (Ed.), *News: A Reader* (291-296). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Sharet, C. (Summer 2004). 9/11, the Useful Incident, and the Legacy of the Creel Committee. *Cinema Journal* 43(4), 125 – 131. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3661164>.
- Taylor, Philip M. (Jul., 1980). The New Propaganda Boom. *The International History Review* 2(3), 485-502. Retrieved from: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40105086>.

Keeping Kerala Secret:

Media Coverage as an Indicator of Anti-Socialist Sentiment

Abstract: This paper summarizes my findings as a blogger for St. Lawrence University's global media blog, the Weave. I used a political economy-based perspective to analyze how the economic system in Kerala, India affects the ability of the state to meet the health care needs of citizens afflicted with malaria. In researching my topic I found there is almost no media coverage of Kerala's exceptional job of nearly eradicating malaria from its state. Only by combining political economic theory with media studies theory was I able to find a link between the lack of media coverage and the type of economic and political systems in Kerala. This paper concludes that because Kerala is a predominately socialist state, Western elites who control news media have purposely not drawn public attention to Kerala's flourishing health care system. Doing so may well undermine the legitimacy of the dominant economic system, capitalism.

Keywords: socialism, healthcare, malaria, public goods, social services, media

Malaria has largely been eradicated in the south Indian state of Kerala with the exception of a few cases (the majority carried by migrant workers immigrating to Kerala from other states) because Kerala's neo-socialist governmental boards have always made providing free universal health care and schooling for all citizens a budgetary priority. To date there are 14 District Malaria Officers in the state. Rates of those who test positively for malaria have dropped dramatically from 10,506 between 1996 and 1997 to 265 cases between 2005 and 2006 (Govt. of Kerala). Socialist principles operating in Kerala decentralize decision-making power so that the fight against malaria is locally and commonly owned and controlled cooperatively. Since 1983 the Zonal Malaria organization, implemented under Multipurpose Workers Scheme,

has carried out detailed entomological studies in vulnerable areas of various districts. In 1994 The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare appointed an expert committee to identify the problem areas and formulate specific strategies to tackle problems in such areas. The Plasmodium (malaria) parasite is incredibly complex and difficult to eradicate, but Kerala's universal health care and allocation of funds to organizations and medical facilities throughout the state has brought Kerala closer to malaria eradication than any other Indian state.

The Kerala model in very simple terms is an alternative model of development in which economic progress results from investment in the well-being of all people within a given society. Kerala has broken the norm of poverty: low-income and GDP levels matched by general low standards of living that is shared by so many developing and underdeveloped states and nations. Given the extraordinary achievements Kerala has acquired in terms of human quality of life despite low GDP and income levels it comes as a surprise that there is little-to-no news media coverage of this topic, regardless of timespan or news source type.

Only after applying political economy-based theory to the state of Kerala and media studies-based theory to the news coverage or lack thereof for this topic can one understand and analyze the connection between the two. The link that is most concrete is the Socialist state- anticommunism filter link which draws from media political economist theorists Edward Herman and Noam Chomsky. From these theorists and others, plus an extensive yet unyielding online search to find any media coverage of Kerala's strong anti-malaria efforts, one can deduce that because Kerala is a predominately Socialist state, Western elites who control news media have purposely not drawn public attention to Kerala's flourishing health care system. It is not in the best interest of Western media outlets to lend attention and thereby legitimacy to the outstanding achievements of any state operating under an economic system that differs from the one they operate under because it may undermine the legitimacy of their dominant system, capitalism.

The state government in Kerala has switched in the last two decades between the Left Democratic Front (LDF) led by the Communist Party of India (Marxist), and the United Democratic Front

(UDF) led by the Indian National Congress. Kerala's government has in the last decade transferred more power and agency to local councils at the panchayat and district levels, which has decentralized democracy in the state. By putting decision-making power in the hands of popular organizations like trade unions, small farmers associations, women's groups, cultural projects, credit and consumer coops, and radical parties, the needs of the majority come first in Kerala (Thorkelson, 258).

The UDF is currently in power, but both ruling parties have demonstrated consistent loyalty towards providing high levels of social services and public goods to Kerala's citizens. The state has empowered citizens by providing free health care and schooling for all, plus safe forms of birth control for women. It has created a highly literate and politically-conscious citizenry which holds its government accountable to operate in the public interest. Well organized local activist groups such as labor unions carry out strikes, protests and marches on a regular basis to make their needs heard and responded to.

Kerala stands out from much of the rest of the developing world in that it is protected from global finance institutions because it is a provincial state and because India is not under pressure from the IMF in the same way as are neo-liberal nations which have adopted the capitalist market system. Furthermore, although India has a high government debt to GDP ratio — about 75% in 2010 — it is, according to Swiss economist Cem Karacadag, “almost entirely financed domestically, thanks to India's high domestic savings rate.” India's debt is financed by internal holdings and is balanced by annual growth in GDP rates (around 6.7% in 2009 and 10.4% in 2010) (Vembu). Because India is not indebted to any foreign finance firms and Kerala is protected from global competition by the federal government buffer, the state government of Kerala has been able to focus on building Kerala from the bottom-up, and without having to do so under the rule of foreign investors and private businesses.

Kerala's focus on providing for its people has allowed it to achieve high levels of social development despite being a poor nation-state. The average income per household is US \$330 per year which means that the state operates at 1/70th the GDP of the United States. While India as a whole has been slipping down the Human

Development Index (HDI) ranking from 126th in 2006 to 134th today, Kerala has the highest HDI ranking in all of India. If Kerala were its own state it would rank 77th in world- ahead of countries with much higher GDP per capita, such as Turkey, South African and Peru (McKibben, 120). Evidence of the Kerala model's success can be seen in its citizens. The number of boys and girls in Kerala schools is nearly equal; state birthrates are 1/4th that of the rest of India (lower even than in the U.S); the state has the lowest child mortality rates in India; the average life expectancy is 74 years (India's average is 62 and the U.S. average is 78) (Stanford); the economy has grown at 9% in last five years- 60% from the service sector, 20% from manufacturing, and 20% from agriculture (Varghuese); and Kerala is one of very few places on the planet which meets the sustainability criteria of having low consumption rates as well as small families (McKibben). Kerala is living proof that GDP levels are not the only or the best indicator of progress, and has demonstrated the ability to leverage its limited GDP to improve general quality of life amongst its citizens.

Kerala's unique development patterns are a reflection of its socialist economic system, publicly-minded government and organized, active and empowered citizens. In defining progress by social markers based on the health, literacy and agency of its people, Kerala has established itself as an extraordinary hub of wealth within the developing world. Creating its own path towards development and improved standards of living has also marked Kerala's opposition to neo-liberal markers of progress. It is this rejection of capitalist principles, practices and values by Kerala, paired with the state's social development successes, that American elites who control our media dislike and even feel threatened by.

Many people in the United States closely associate Socialism with Communism, and have a long history of anti-Communist resentment culminating in the Second Red Scare that came after WWII in the late 1940s- late 1950s. At their most basic definitions, Socialism is an economic system based on the idea that the working class should take over and run things collectively, democratically and for the benefit of the majority while Communism is an economic and political system based on the idea that that society should not have classes. Still many Americans fail to understand

the differences between the two and consciously or not apply anti-Communist sentiment to Socialist states like Kerala.

Anti-communist propaganda, resentment and McCarthyism may seem like a thing of the past in the U.S., but closer inspection reveals that it still exists and is now perpetuated in less outright ways. The mainstream media influences anti-communist and anti-socialist sentiments to a large extent because the media have great ideological power, or the authority to tell people what to think about or what not to think about. This essay analyzes the few existing news reports on the topic of malaria in Kerala, focusing mainly on what is missing from the media coverage.

Modern Indian and Keralan media have covered some resurgences of malaria cases in Kerala state over the last few years but health articles and reports are mainly devoted to more pressing disease outbreaks and health threats. An article titled “Malaria Resurgence Worries Thrissur” featured in *The Hindu*, one of India’s leading newspapers, explains that malaria rates are slightly on the rise in Kerala, but does not point any fingers at governmental or medical officials. Instead the author relates increased malaria rates to environmental factors, the complex nature of the virus, and the movement of goods and people between states (Muringatheri). Local news articles on the topic remain neutral, stating that resurgences are causing concern for health authorities but that they are taking matters into their own hands and working to mitigate the presence of malaria. Overall it seems that Keralites have faith in the ability of their governmental and medical officials and the institutions that they work for in mitigating the spread of malaria in the state. While Indian coverage of malaria in Kerala is minimal, it is important because it denaturalizes the idea spread by U.S. mainstream media that second and third world nations are characterized by poor human health and even poorer state response. Indian news coverage does not tell of in any way a desperate situation, the need for outside medical or financial aid, or of public discontent with state’s health care system. In recent years, as malaria has been largely kept at bay and shows itself only in low numbers during the rainy season or in migrant laborers, it has lost its place in much of the local media coverage. The fact that there is little domestic media coverage of malaria is only logical in this sense.

Whereas a lack of media coverage of malaria-response efforts is logical on a local and national level, there should be or have been more international and particularly western media coverage of this topic. To report on the story of Kerala- a tropical, far-off land- and its impressive ability to drastically decrease malaria rates, one of the most common killers of low-income, tropical populations, would suit the journalistic ideals of being investigative, working in the interest of the public, and making information accessible (Collins). It seems that despite the opportunity for producing good journalism that the “story” of Kerala’s health care provides journalists, no American news media outlets have had interest in covering this topic.

Noam Chomsky and Edward Herman’s anti-communism filter can be applied to explain the dichotomization of U.S. media coverage. While India as a whole is an ally of the US, history tells us that any state or nation that is socialist is more of an enemy than an ally in the eyes of American politicians. Chomsky and Herman state that media coverage is selected not because of news-worthiness but by elite interests (22). U.S. mainstream media perpetuate the same anti-communist sediment that simultaneously brought together and turned Americans against one another during the Cold War era by either putting news reports about communist or socialist states in a negative light, or, as we see with Kerala, by ignoring the happenings, events and successes of the state altogether. The anti-communist filter simultaneously praises and endorses capitalism while scaring people away from alternative economic systems like socialism.

American mainstream media sources have largely failed to cover Kerala state’s outstanding anti-malarial work. Reports either lump all of India together and thereby hide the extraordinary success Kerala has had in the fight against the spread of malaria, or cover malaria-stricken states across the developing world as if they are a single entity, all at the same place in terms of eradication efforts and all in need of western aid. The *New York Times* article “Comeback Against Malaria,” asserts that in the last three years WHO and World Bank efforts have been paying off but international funding needs to be increased. “Rich nations need to do more” the author claims (New York Times).

U.S. media portray malaria response efforts as up to the U.S. and other Western donors, and rarely even entertain the idea that antimalarial campaigns can come from the nations experiencing the disease firsthand. Another *New York Times* article sings “two cheers for the vaccine”, praising British pharmaceutical giant GlaxoSmith-Kline for producing the latest vaccine hoped to eradicate malaria (Duff). The vaccine, unfortunately named “Mosquirix”, is the most frequent result pertaining to malaria found when searching within mainstream U.S. news websites. The big pharma company is quoted as the primary expert on malaria and company representatives support their own findings in news articles. Chomsky and Herman’s news makers filter applies to this report because the media is reliant on corporate representatives who are on one hand “experts” who provide information about malaria and on the other hand are entrepreneurs using the media as a platform to advertise their products. Between the media’s praise for western, empirical medical research and its calls for more Americans to donate money for international aid efforts, it is clear that U.S. mainstream media players are working to reproduce and lend legitimacy to the notion that the West knows best when it comes to combating malaria.

The lack of media news coverage of Kerala’s flourishing health care system is an indicator that U.S. media do not want to draw public attention to the successes of a neo-Socialist government operating under a Socialist economic system. The *New York Times* articles which assert that the money and big pharma drugs of the U.S. and other western nations are the solution to malaria are effectively reproducing what Lawrence Grossberg calls the “dominant ideology” or the mainstream, taken-for-granted socio-cultural consciousness or reality perpetuated, naturalized, and universalized by global hegemony (178). Grossberg states, “In the contemporary world, the media are involved in the production of ideology all the time” (182). As powerful ideological institutions, the media present to the public what is generally accepted as the reality of the world. Therefore, when popular *New York Times* journalists imply in their news reports that the western, foreign-aided top-down approach to fighting malaria is the only way the disease can be controlled, the public are convinced this is so. Inherent in this ideology is the assumption that the opposite: non-western, grassroots, localized and

decentralized approaches to combatting malaria are non-existent, not possible, and are a poorer option overall.

US political, military and economic interests influence media coverage of my topic in that elites from these rings control a great amount of the information provided to the media. Jaap Van Ginneken, author of “Who Gets to Speak in the World News” says that media sourcing is usually from party-affiliated organizations, think tanks, or government officials themselves (87). For the *New York Times* and other U.S. media sources, the primary agenda setter is the White House, the second is the Pentagon, and the third is the State Department. Applauding a poor Indian state for achieving human health standards equal to those in the United States is not on the agenda of these political institutions. To them, this story threatens undermining the dominant political and economic systems in the U.S. It is interesting that the U.S. is a moderate, center-leaning country but our news leans towards the right-wing, conservative side. Conservative’s resentment of anything socialist could well explain the media’s decision to turn a blind eye to Kerala’s health care system success.

American citizens or any people who read, watch or listen to US mainstream media reports will almost never get the idea from the media that there are potentially economic systems besides capitalism that work, never mind that socialism may well work better in meeting the real needs of people. In our uniquely competitive capitalist society where political, economic and military elites are both the economic benefitters as well as the controllers of the institutions that run our country, news media publications have become a platform on which societal elites who enjoy increased access to the media can naturalize, legitimize and promote their own interests. This is why not highlighting Kerala’s extraordinary anti-malaria efforts and health care milestones while praising big pharma has the dual effect of legitimizing the U.S. and other advanced western nations as holders of some sort of superior knowledge while positioning the places struggling with malaria-response as mere receivers of the aid from more developed parts of the world.

Media coverage, or lack thereof, of my story reveals that Western elites see socialism as a threat to the dominant economic system under which they operate. Only because Kerala is a socialist state

does praising its health care system indirectly become praise for the state's economic system. Kerala's impressive malaria control program and ability to reach disproportionately high levels of well-being shows that putting people and their needs at the center of societal goals is an alternative and quite possibly better way to develop than the profit-oriented development goals of capitalist societies. Under the socialist system in Kerala, participatory democracy and decentralized authority have provided increased opportunities for the voices of people from all classes to be more equally heard than they are in top-down nations like the U.S. The U.S. media and the elites who control them do not want to spread information about the success of Kerala for fear of instigating change elsewhere. If other developing nations adopt similar political and economic systems to Kerala's and develop their own version of the Kerala model, then they would effectively be rejecting the Washington Consensus and thereby the authority of the U.S. government and American corporations. Capitalism relies on these nations for cheap labor, natural resources, and waste dumping and without them, capitalism would die. If the people in the US started demanding that the real needs of the whole of society be addressed by the state as people in Kerala have done for half a century, the values and agency of political and economic heavy-weights would be checked and altered by the citizens they serve.

The ideals of journalism which include providing news coverage that is subject neither to commercial, religious, nor political interests are undermined by the capitalist system under which journalism operates. Quality of news content and the media's ability to facilitate democratic exchange are sacrificed in larger endeavors of gaining more customers and thereby profits. Emerging mediums such as alternative journalism which is not so closely tied to capitalist institutions can fill the information gap by covering this story and under-reported stories like it. Journalists need to move outside the production and reproduction of the dominant ideology and beyond the taken for granted assumptions of the media of individualism, capitalism, self vs. the other, and the nation. There doesn't have to be a "right and wrong" way to develop and improve the livelihoods of people around the world, and the economic and political agendas of the nations or states making the media shouldn't affect the agen-

das of the media themselves. Media have the ability to make and perpetuate structured inequalities amongst groups within a given society and amongst global populations, but they also have the ability to do good. In the current age of information, thanks in great part to the internet, the media are no longer limited by national borders. They can help to break down further barriers of inequality and to facilitate the creation of global communities.

Bibliography

- Chomsky, Noam and Edward Herman, "Manufacturing Consent: The Political Economy of the Mass Media" Pantheon Books. New York: 2-35. Print
- Collins, John. Lecture on the ideals of journalism. September 11, 2011.
- "Comeback Against Malaria." New York Times Company, 18 Dec. 2010 Web. 30 Oct. 2011. <<http://www.nytimes.com/2010/12/19/opinion/19sun2.html?adxnnl=1>>.
- Government of Kerala, *Health & Family Welfare Department*. Dept. of Information & Public Relations, http://www.kerala.gov.in/index.php?option=com_content&view=category&layout=blog&id=65&Itemid=324 Nov. 14, 2011.
- "Killer fever strikes back in Kerala" Asia Net Satellite Communications, 2008 Web. 2 Nov. 2011. http://www.asianetindia.com/whats-hot/killer-fever-kerala_64714.html
- McKibben, Bill, "Kerala" Hope, Human and Wild. Little Brown. 1995: 118-151.
- Muringatheri, Mini. "Malaria Resurgence Worries Thrissur." The Hindu, 11 July 2010. Web. 01 Nov. 2011. <<http://www.thehindu.com/news/states/kerala/article510865.ece>>.
- Stanford, Jim. "As they say in Kerala, there's more to life than GDP" Beyond Thoughts: There's more to the truth than just the facts... <http://beyondthoughts.posterous.com/archive/3/2010?page=2>

Thorkelson, Nick, "The Washington Consensus and the Kerala Alternative,"
Dollars & Sense March/April 2001: Print.

Van Ginneken, Jaap, "Understanding Global News" Sage, London: 85-108. Print.

Varghese, Anil. Lecture. May 20, 2011. Kerala, India.

Vembu, Venkatesan "India immune to Greek tragedy, say economists," DNA:
Daily News Analysis. Feb 5, 2010. Web. Nov. 10, 2011. http://www.dnaindia.com/money/report_india-immune-to-greek-tragedy-say-economists_1343885

Wilson, Duff. "Glaxo Settles Cases With U.S. for \$3 Billion." *New York Times: BusinessDay*. The New York Times Company, 3 Nov. 2011. Web. 1 Nov. 2011. <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/11/04/business/glaxo-to-pay-3-billion-in-avandia-settlement.html?_r=3&ref=health>.v

Constructed Reality: The Strength and Weakness of Visual Spectacles

Abstract: This piece examines the use of media spectacles in American society and the 1998 film, the Siege. The sequence of events during the terrorist attacks in the film has a strong correlation with the ones that took place in the United States in 2001. Even more interestingly, the argument can be made that the very nature of the attacks and the intention of the creators is also similar because of the use of media. Both in the film and in reality, the attacks were planned to manipulate American citizens through the use of shocking media images, in order to sway the way the population perceived the attacks. The immediate response by the military and government in both cases was to produce a set of competing images and an alternative framework for Americans to view the events through. The two types of visual spectacles, one produced by terrorists and one by the government, were broadcasted by the media and resulted in emotional responses which transformed the way people viewed their own society. The contrast to be made between the actual events in America and the ones in the film is the degree to which the creators of spectacle were able to naturalize their ideology, determining an enduring conceptualization for Americans of the attacks on the nation as well as the constitution of their own society.

Keywords: 9/11; terrorism; visual spectacle; naturalization

The attacks on the World Trade Center on September 11th, 2001 were planned to have an extraordinary impact on American citizens and government organizations due to the incredibly emotional response to the violent assault (Kellner 1). Many media representations of the event, which were heavily influenced by the government, were designed to “dominate public attention” and shape public understanding of the attacks (Kellner 1, Collins and Egan). The Siege, a film directed by Ed Zwick offers view-

ers an understanding of how both a radical Muslim group and the American military employed visual spectacles via the media. These spectacles were used to produce fear, and shape public response to and understanding of their conflict—albeit to different ends. Both spectacles in the film achieved the desired effects temporarily but failed to truly naturalize the ideas of their creators, which destroyed their power over the population. Yet the extent of the consequences for American society has yet to become fully evident.

Two representative groups in The Siege create visual spectacles. The first spectacle is a series of explosions, perpetrated by a radical Muslim group and targeting American civilians. Spectacle refers to “an event designed to generate widespread, even obsessive media attention and whose social impact derives as much from its media representation as from its material effects,” (Collins and Egan). The bombings were a spectacle because they were meant to seize the media’s attention and generate fear through television images, as much as they were to cause physical damage.¹ One on-looker commented, “They are waiting for the cameras, they want everybody watching,” when news helicopters gathered just before a bus exploded (The Siege script).²

The targets, including the FBI, public transportation, an elementary school and a theatre, were symbolic of security, solidarity, innocence, privilege, and prospectively. The destruction of these symbols by the Muslim radicals, each pertaining to the United States’ idealistic exemption from violence, was not intended to cause casualties to those groups but to threaten their significance to America as a whole.³ The acceptance of a new, dangerous reality based on the loss of these symbols demonstrated the power of the radicals at that time, as evidenced by the “73% decrease in retail sales” (Kellner 1, The Siege). The fact that half of the nation

1 The first bombing didn’t injure any civilians; it was an explosion of paint on a bus. It was intended to create fear without causing any physical damage.

2 In the scene depicting the second bus bombing, the shot is taken from a news helicopter moving down toward the bus, demonstrating the way the public sees events through the lens of the camera.

3 The attack on the theatre resulted in the death of “scores of the cities wealthiest and brightest,” which shows that the target was chosen to “make real” (or ‘more real’) matters that the privileged and the merely safe might prefer to ignore” (The Siege, Songtag 7).

kept their kids out of school and the terrified reaction of pedestrians in one scene to the sound of an engine backfiring demonstrate the drastic effect the attacks had on society.

The radicals also presented a discourse to the American public in the form of spectacle. Discourse involves giving significance to an event, such as a terrorist attack, to serve particular interests (Collins and Egan). In the film, one bomber said that he wanted Americans to “bleed as we have bled,” referring to the mistreatment of his people by the United States (The Siege script). The bombings were meant to teach American citizens and officials “the consequences of trying to tell the world how to live” in light of the radicals’ resentment of the United States’ actions abroad. The bombers also wanted to give meaning to their cause; the sacrifice of life turned them and their victims into martyrs.⁴

Social meaning was also created by the American military in the film; the military used media spectacle to naturalize a set of ideas in American society. The military constructed a new reality for the citizens through the news; after repeatedly seeing representative images of military power on television, the population watched the invasion of New York and the detainment of Muslims passively. As the bombings continued, prominent military officials explained on television that the institution of martial law was necessary in order to find any remaining terrorists in New York City. The news report was a spectacle because the citizens “experienced social and political conflict primarily through visual media, in ways that played on base emotions and distracted attention from historical understanding,” (Collins and Egan). They failed to question the inclusion or exclusion of information from the news and allowed their views to be shaped by images which they assumed were “objective” portrayals of reality, which is consistent with Susan Sontag’s analysis of American perception of the news (52- 57).

The image of an army general in uniform, flanked by soldiers and tanks served to distract citizens from the injustice he was actually proposing. He reinforced the notion that “the most fearsome

⁴ The image of the victims on the bus exemplifies the nature of martyrdom and sacrifice. Their arms are raised, hands placed on the window, in a way that speaks to their helplessness as well as the symbol of a crucifix; Christ with his arms raised on the cross. Sontag states that “violence can exalt someone... into a martyr or a hero” (12).

military machine in the history of man” was going to dutifully protect the American people by profiling and capturing Muslim men (The Siege script). The spectacle, representative images of power on the news, was propaganda used to naturalize the military’s ideology.

The military spectacle on the news created a perception for fearful citizens that a “binding contract” would ensure their protection (Engle 79). The head general described his search for “no more than twenty ... hiding in a population of two million,” framing the difficulty and urgency of his mission (The Siege script). The presentation of the military’s search for the bombers portrayed Muslims as “a kind of virus, eating away at the system from the inside,” (Engle 71). Dissent was therefore silenced by fear and desire for protection; the military’s power to use spectacle as a political weapon was demonstrated by the compliant response of citizens.⁵

However, the spectacles in the film only produced the desired effects for a limited time because flaws in the ideologies were exposed and the newly naturalized meanings were rejected. Once citizens recovered from the initial shock of each spectacle, they disagreed with the new constructions of reality. The terrorists produced overwhelming fear that actually worked against their cause because, as Douglas Kellner states, “made-for-media events . . . create fearful populations more likely to be manipulated by reactionary forces who give simplistic answers,” (8). The military provided a more comforting interpretation of the events and groups involved. Yet when their abusive and tyrannical tactics became increasingly extreme and clearly ineffective, the public protested and the military’s power dissolved. The unstable nature of extreme discourses in the film calls into question how effectively a visual spectacle can naturalize new values in a society.

Both groups in The Siege grafted meanings onto events and groups which were accepted in the moment of fearful paralysis immediately following the events but were later contested. This is evident in the massive protest that broke out in the film in response to the prolonged detainment of Muslim men. The question

5 Half of Americans favored domestic military intervention after the bombing of an FBI building, evidence that the people desired protection (The Siege).

then becomes, what brought the citizens in The Siege to reject the discourses? The radical Muslims' ideas and construction of society were undermined because military officials provided a more safe and secure alternative. Afterward, the protest against the military's discourse occurred because the citizens dis-identified with the constructed roles of the military and Muslims in society (Collins and Egan). Therefore, correlation of the events of 9/11 with the ones in The Siege further proves that media spectacles can be deliberate political weapons, while contrasting the ability of a real population, traumatized by domestic attacks and influenced by the military, to reject a discourse. Post 9/11, there was a similar "circulation of media images which increased panic and fear," (Kellner 1 -2). The "origins... and effects [of the attacks] were unclear to the public," which responded to the images with overwhelming fear. Americans then pledged their blind allegiance, allowing officials to "exploit the spectacle and push through a rightwing agenda," which resulted in serious human rights violations (Kellner 8). The key difference between 9/11 and the fictional spectacles in The Siege is the ability of American society to reject a discourse that contradicts its fundamental values.

In the film, citizens recognize and condemn the "disconnect between the message of government (liberty for all) and its arrival (liberty for some)," diminishing the power of the attackers and military over the population. However, in reality it has only escalated because of Americans' passive response (Engel 75). Perhaps in reality, the majority actually supported retribution at the expense of integrity, or the actions of the government were invisible enough that the citizens were not compelled to protest. Perhaps emotions are more easily manipulated to accept contrived meanings in American society than they were demonstrated to be in The Siege. Maybe Americans remain too fearful to refuse military protection, or are willing to sacrifice the rights of the few for the good of the many. In any case, the director of The Siege offers hope for Americans that it may be possible to resist the most determined attempts to change the values of our society, if we can collectively recognize and object to these efforts.

Bibliography

- Egan, Danielle, and John Collins. "From Language to Discourse." FYP Permanent War, Permanent Trauma? Atwood Hall, St Lawrence University. Oct. 2011. Lecture
- Egan, Danielle, and John Collins. "Regarding the Pain of Others: Susan Sontag." FYP Permanent War, Permanent Trauma? Atwood Hall, St Lawrence University. Oct. 2011. Lecture.
- Egan, Danielle, and John Collins. Spectacle. FYP Permanent War, Permanent Trauma? Atwood Hall, St Lawrence University. Oct. 2011. Lecture.
- Engle, Karen. «Postcard Memories.» *Seeing: 9/11 and the Visual Imagination*. Montreal: McGill - Queen's University Press, 2009. 51- 77. Print.
- Internet Movie Script Database, et al. «'The Siege' Script and Screenplay.» *Internet Movie Script Database*. N.p., n.d. Web. 30 Oct. 2011. <<http://www.imsdb.com/scripts/Siege,-The.html>>.
- Kellner, Douglas. *Social Memory and the Representation of 9/11 in Contemporary Hollywood Film*. Los Angeles: n.p., 2005. Print.
- Sontag, Susan. *Regarding the Pain of Others*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2003. Print.
- Zwick, Edward, et al. *The Siege*. 1998. Twentieth Century Fox Film Corporation. DVD.

Political Economy and the Marginalized: The Effects of an Exclusive Structure

Abstract: Political economy is a social structure that exists and is created by society, but fundamentally leaves many individuals ostracized from the wealth, power, and capital that are ruled by the few. The paper, using the film Land of Plenty, demonstrates this unequal distribution. It uses individual characters and their distinct experiences, alongside the frameworks of political economy and endocolonization to illustrate the skewedness of the structures' inner workings and its widespread ramifications. Articles from the scholars Andrew J. Bacevich and Judith Butler, are used to emphasize the connection between what the film reveals and the existence of that in today's society. Ultimately, the paper uses the film and given frameworks to elucidate the complexity of the political economy and challenges us to evaluate it, the nature of its cycle, but more specifically, our continuous contributions to it.

Key Words: political economy; endocolonization; social structure; wealth; capital; power; war; conditions

In Leonard Cohen's song "The Land of Plenty", there is a discrepancy between the image of a nation swelling with abundance, and the "millions in the prison that wealth has set apart"; this song speaks to a desire that eventually the inadequacy of such a social system will be revealed. This false impression is underlined in the appropriately named film Land of Plenty, which delves into the relationship between a young woman and her uncle on their journey to discover why a man was murdered and who he truly was. Their voyage brings the viewer insight on political economy, "the social system that shapes the conditions governing the circulation, accumulation, and distribution of wealth, capital, and power" (Collins and Egan, 2). Besides political economy, the director uses another frame, endocolonization, to help illuminate how such a

complex structure functions. Endocolonization describes the internal colonization of a population after its integration into another distinct territory for the purpose of extracting materials and diverting wealth to the dominant group (Collins and Egan, 13-14). These concepts and the larger framework are demonstrated in the film by the characters' differing experiences. In the film Land of Plenty, the demonstration of wealth as power and the unequal distribution of both power and wealth within the various socioeconomic classes is highlighted not by its own presence, but rather through the characters' unique experiences facing the repercussions of a political economy that neither supports nor benefits them; while each character represents a different position within a larger social system, they are brought together through the Bread of Life Mission in a way that illustrates the operation of endocolonization.

One of the leading characters in this film, Paul, is a veteran whose psychological state is a demonstration of the individual extraction he has experienced during his service in the Vietnam War. Paul's unique type of endocolonization, the extraction of his 'resources' by the government, results in the close overlap between his identity and the military. He cannot separate himself from the lens in which he is fearful and perceives constant threat, as well as the paranoia that people are out to get the U.S. as well as him. Paul demonstrates this mentality during a scene that shows him observing a Middle Eastern man, an identified suspect, who is murdered in front of Paul (Land of Plenty). This murder occurs outside The Bread of Life Mission, a homeless shelter in L.A. that symbolizes the overlap of each character's position within the social structure of society. Before the murder, while waiting for the identified suspect, Paul makes a comment illustrating the perceptions behind his mentality. His position in the social structure largely revolves around his distorted view of self, a result of what his country has taken from him. "Enjoy that sandwich because that sandwich is going to cost you, no free lunch in this country" (Land of Plenty). This quote clearly demonstrates Paul's belief that everything comes with a price. He has never known a time when he did not have a specific purpose or was not intentionally utilized. For Paul, there is no such thing as a free sandwich. For this reason, he represents all that is taken by the country, both on an individual and national

level, to maintain a political economy largely reliant on war and its endless preparation.

Following Paul's involvement in the military, he is left with little more than a rigid and skewed configuration of the world. In the article "The Tyranny of Defense Inc.," Andrew J. Bacevich discusses the implications of a social system where the money is directed toward the war effort so that "the nation as a whole suffers from acute economic distress" (7). He contends that we are "diverting social capital from productive to destructive purposes" and quotes President Eisenhower's beliefs, "Any nation that pours its treasure into the purchase of armaments is spending more than mere money. 'It is spending the sweat of its laborers, the genius of its scientists, the hopes of its children'" (Bacevich, 2-3). These quotes demonstrate the harsh reality of the effects of spending excessive money on war. Paul's character in Land of Plenty illustrates a small but significant example of how the use of an individual by the country as a crusader in the battle of U.S. ideology is left with the extreme effects of being exploited and then disregarded.

Paul displays the effects of individual extraction, but Hasaan, the Middle Eastern suspect, is the result of endocolonization; he represents the outcome of a political economy in which the extraction of resources in his homeland has displaced him and forced him into the poverty of Los Angeles. He was displaced from his home presumably because a larger power invaded the area in an ideological battle as well as an effort to extract oil and accumulate wealth. Hasaan is located at the bottom of the social structure; he embodies the scum of the structure, a foreigner who survives with little food, money, and no shelter (Land of Plenty). Hasaan is unique because unlike Paul who has dedicated his life to embracing U.S. patriotism, Hasaan is part of a movement of people, caused by war and a political economy that has diverted the wealth, removed materials from his homeland, and dislodged natives. From Hasaan's accent and his traditional Middle Eastern garb, it can be assumed that he was not born in the United States. As Hasaan professes to Paul's niece at the Mission, "My home is not a place, it is people" (Land of Plenty). Hasaan does not display loyalty to one area, but rather a group of individuals that share customs, faith, and experiences. Unfortunately, after Hasaan was relocated, he faced the predestined poverty.

Although Hasaan is not American, Bacevich emphasizes how easy it is for an individual to fall far below the poverty line. “If paying Pashtun drivers to truck fuel from Pakistan into Afghanistan is producing any positive economic side effects, the American worker is not one of them” (8). If the American worker is not benefiting from such a system, then a foreigner is not benefiting either. Hasaan’s experience within this system highlights the global effects of endocolonization and the emphasis on wealth, power, and capital; the importance of these things displaces millions each year creating a nation that “suffers from acute economic distress” (Bacevich, 7).

This distress that Bacevich describes is shockingly evident when Lana, Paul’s niece, arrives to the United States after growing up in Africa and the Middle East (7). She is confronted with the effects of colonization in a country that is believed to be virtuous. For Lana, the jarring realization of “the excessive military outlays, the privileging of institutional goals over the national interest, [and] the calculated manipulation of public opinion” led her to reevaluate what she believed America stood for, what that looked like, and how the two differed. She proves to be a complex and paradoxical character because although she is a cultured citizen, she is initially unknowing of the reality the economy has created in America. At the end of the film, Lana comments on her experience of living abroad following 9/11 and how excited people were, exclaiming how much they hated Americans and America, “They came from such an honest place and from so many people that, I just, I knew that something had gone wrong and that’s become my nightmare” (Land of Plenty). Lana is torn between being patriotic to her own country and her morals, ones that require decency to all humans, and justice for someone such as Hasaan. She recognizes the alleged enemies are individuals coming from an “honest place”, a place not entirely different from America. In this economy, she is one of the few who can acknowledge the discrepancy between the ideology of political economy and the reality of it; Lana came to the Western world only to find that the violence, hatred, and poverty she believed to have left behind miraculously existed in the place that was supposed to be omnipotent.

In Land of Plenty, Paul, Hasaan, and Lana all individually demonstrate the effects of a political economy and endocolonization; together they help illustrate the widely ramifying consequences of such a structure. They illuminate the unequal distribution of wealth, the emphasis on power in society, and the general fallacy that the United States is not significantly marginalized. This film provokes the viewer to ponder the cycle and nature of this social structure today, what creates it and how it is sustained. As Judith Butler emphasizes in Precarious Life: The Powers of Mourning and Violence, it is the globes' responsibility to evaluate the conditions that shape the global community and be able to "re-create social and political conditions on more sustaining grounds" (17-18). Just by looking at the United States, data demonstrates the need to facilitate the creation and the evolution of conditions that are based on more "sustaining grounds". The 2010 U.S. census indicates one of out every seven American's fall below the poverty line, a number that has only increased recently. As the amount of people who fall below this line increases, the money spent on war increases as well. It now costs one million dollars to "train, equip, and maintain" one soldier in Iraq (Bacevich, 8). A social structure as intricate as ours and the process of obtaining others resources for wealth, may be the foundation for the current functioning of the country as we know it; this does not mean it must stay this way marginalizing, estranging, and damaging its own people in the process.

Bibliography

Bacevich, Andrew J. "The Tyranny of Defense Inc." *The Atlantic Magazine* Jan.-Feb. 2011: 1-8. *The Atlantic*. Web. 19 Sept. 2011. <<http://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2011/01/the-tyranny-of-defense-inc/8342/>>.

Butler, Judith. *Precarious Life: The Powers of Mourning and Violence*. New York: Verso, 2004. Print.

Cohen, Leonard. "The Land of Plenty." *YouTube*. Web. 30 Oct. 2011. <<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wHMxKgNbATo>>.

Collins, John, and Danielle Egan. "Key Concepts and Definitions." Permanent War, Permanent Trauma? St. Lawrence University. 6 Sept. 2011. Lecture.

Land of Plenty. Wim Wenders. Emotion Pictures, InDigEnt (Independent Digital Entertainment), Reverse Angle International, 2004. Film.

Suicide Bombings: Terrorist Attack or Mourning Gone Wrong?

Abstract: This paper examines the background of suicide bomber, Wasim, one of the main characters in the 2005 film, *Syriana*. The author argues that in the case of this particular young man his suicide bombing was not the product of a terrorist organization or radical teachings but rather from pent up melancholic feelings. The paper covers the transgression of Wasim from a disgruntled immigrant experiencing mourning over his unemployment to desperate suicide bomber with raging emotions of melancholia. It covers the dehumanizing events that toppled Wasim into a pit of melancholia that he could not escape. In the end, the paper concludes that in his mind self-annihilation was the only way to prove himself worthy and to feel some relief from his grief: gaining some recognition in a world that had been depriving him of this.

Keywords: mourning; melancholia; libido; reality principle; self-annihilation

Since September 11, 2001, the phrases “terrorist attack” and “suicide bombing” have been virtually interchangeable. There is a dangerous misconception that suicide bombings are always connected to the idea of terrorism. However, the suicide bombing depicted in the film, *Syriana*, is the result of melancholia and therefore problematizes the construction of terrorism and the terrorist that is common in US discourse. This melancholia developed because Wasim, a young immigrant, was downtrodden by poverty and deprived of his humanity (*Syriana*). These losses caused a mild case of mourning over his lost job to quickly transform into an unstable and destructive state of melancholia that emerged because of his loss of recognition in society.

Syriana follows multiple plot lines, which focus on the corruption of the oil business in the Middle East, and all come together

within the last ten minutes of the movie. One of the final scenes is of Wasim and Farooq; both frustrated migrant workers, with a stinger missile headed straight into a Connex-Killen tanker (Syriana). To most people, this would be easily perceived as a terrorist attack, and left at that. However, when one takes time to look at the journey of Wasim Khan, a young man from Pakistan trying to find work in order to keep his Visa after being laid off from Connex, it is clear that the decision to take his life was due an unresolved case of mourning which gradually slipped into melancholia.

Mourning, as defined by Freud, is the withdrawal of libido from a specific object. Libido is the life drive, an individual's instinctual psychic energy resulting from primitive desires for sexual pleasure or in the case of Wasim, self-preservation (Freud 243-244). It often occurs when an object, ideal, or person is suddenly absent from an individual's life. The individual then struggles to give up the energy connected to whom or what was lost, and this is expressed through symptoms such as crying, sadness, grief, and anger (Egan and Collins). Mourning is usually overcome when the Reality Principle, which allows for the individual to realize the object is gone for good, takes effect and a slow healing process begins (Freud 243-244).

This type of mourning is exemplified in Wasim's character. Since both he and his father were Pakistani migrant workers for Connex, the switch of management at the facility meant that not only were they unemployed, but they also had to find new sources of lodging and food (Syriana). These circumstances put a huge amount of pressure on Wasim because the stability of his family and future had unexpectedly disappeared. The viewer can see the burden Wasim feels when he no longer interacts or jokes with his friends. He immediately shows signs of depression, caused by the perspective of deportation and poverty that come with long term unemployment. The anger aspect of mourning can also be seen when Wasim becomes increasingly upset at a close friend who cannot help Wasim with his job hunt. Wasim is constantly asking his friend to put in a good word with his uncle and frustrated when his friend fails to deliver results (Syriana).

Wasim's mental state, however, is more extreme than mourning— other characters experience loss, including Wasim's father,

Saleem Khan. He also loses his job and faces all the same challenges as Wasim but is able to recover in a way that Wasim is not. One scene of the film depicts Saleem enjoying a game of cricket with friends (Syriana). He can engage in this because he is not as distraught or consumed by losing his job. Wasim's feelings do not lessen with time, which is why mere mourning does not explain his mental state.

Although Wasim grasps the Reality Principle, he still slips into a dangerous form of melancholia. Usually when the Reality Principle sets in, the individual can overcome their case of mourning. Wasim understands what is going on in the world around him, he grasps the Reality Principle. He understands that he needs a job, food, and shelter. However, he does not grasp the context of living in a situation where he is not considered to be human. This is the point in which mourning turns into melancholia. Freud defined melancholia as the withdrawal of the libido from the world. This loss of an object or ideal is not always clear to the individual experiencing it; many times it is a loss that is experienced in the unconscious. Freud believed that, "...melancholia is in some way related to an object-loss which is withdrawn from consciousness, in contradistinction to mourning, in which there is nothing about the loss that is unconscious" (Freud 245). This is where melancholia and mourning differ. With melancholia come self-depreciation, self-reproach, and sometimes self-annihilation (Egan and Collins). Wasim feels an intense internal loss beyond the material ones that are commonly felt by others in his community. His libido has not attached to anything new, he is consumed by his loss, and he feels devalued.

Although *Syriana* focuses on a wide variety of characters, the time spent focused on Wasim shows a number of dehumanizing events that help explain his transgression to melancholia. One scene depicts Wasim being beaten in front of his fellow workers just for speaking while standing in line (Syriana). To make grown men and young adults stand in line like school age children is humiliating, but to then be punished for merely speaking is mortifying. The pivotal moment, the one that makes the entire experience dehumanizing however, is how unmercifully he is beaten. In the specific scene, Wasim is clubbed numerous times by men in

uniform, undoubtedly native to the country he is trying to make his home. Other degrading factors include being turned away or ignored for not being able to speak Arabic. One man said to him, “And if you want to work in the country, learn how to speak the language” (Syriana Script). Wasim had multiple experiences of rejection and mistreatment while attempting to find his way out of mourning, until he eventually lost his ability to recover. At this point he fell victim to melancholia.

Wasim finds an opportunity to express his growing resentment for himself and others while at school. Wasim and Farooq enroll in an Islamic school to try to master Arabic. Here, they meet the charismatic and haunting Mohammed Sheik Agiza (Syriana). Agiza gains the boys trust and slowly promotes his views of Islam to the two young men. “When God Almighty has chosen us for important work, we have no choice but complete submission” (Syriana Script). Lessons like this become increasingly common for Wasim and the additional time spent in school exposes him to the idea of suicide bombing. After watching a farewell video of a suicide bomber that depicts his final wishes, Agiza reassures the students that the man in the video had an immense impact on those he left behind. He tells them that the suicide bomber continues to live and inspire others, and that his fame is still spreading (Syriana). Wasim’s feelings of insignificance, cause him to perceive this an opportunity to prove his worth. He seeks to show that he has not let his family down, to show the men who beat him in the streets that he is significant, and to show the job that he was laid off from that he has a voice. The combination of intense desire to prove his worth, a state of melancholia from serious losses of humanity, and the influence of the sheik all lead him to self-annihilation.

Wasim and Farooq are seen for the last time, in the final few minutes of *Syriana*, in a small fishing boat headed straight towards a Connex-Killen tanker named Condoleeza Rice. The tanker is owned by same company who put him out of work only months earlier (Syriana). As their small boat, armed with the stinger missile, enters the shadow of the tanker with the intention to strike, a wide, proud smile appears on Wasim’s face, and he seems to be at peace as the screen explodes to white.

Nowhere in the film does Wasim’s character come across as

fundamentalist or hint a desire to inflict violence and terror on the innocent. This fact and his melancholic experiences prove that the suicide bombing in the film *Syriana* was not a terrorist-encouraged act. This bombing was not committed to strike fear into the hearts of the innocent, or to advance the Islamic name. Wasim's inhumane treatment drove mourning to melancholia, where being worthless became an everyday experience that he was constantly reminded of. He could not step out into the world without someone there reminding him that he was not a human in their eyes. He suffered immensely, from being turned away from work to violent outbreaks. In his mind, the only way to prove himself commendable and to feel some sort of relief from his constant melancholic emotions was through self-annihilation. This forced recognition in a world where it was denied.

Bibliography

- Egan, Danielle, and John Collins. "Mourning and Melancholia." Atwood Hall, St. Lawrence University. Lecture.
- Freud, Sigmund. *Mourning and Melancholia*. Trans. Joan Riviere. N.p.: n.p., n.d. 239-58. Print.
- Syriana*. Stephen Gaghan. 2005. Warner Brothers.
- "Syriana Script." *Warner Brothers*. N.p., n.d. Web. 1 Nov. 2011. <<http://pdl.warnerbros.com/wbmovies/syriana/site/med/Syriana-Screenplay.pdf>>.

How People Connect: Determining What Defines the Ways in Which

Abstract: This autoethnography explores and compares how average Chinese citizens live and interact with one another versus the average American experience. What my research aimed to discover was whether humanity is basically the same everywhere, or if our different cultures cause us to interact and behave in completely different ways, ultimately altering our relationships, habits, and philosophies. During my time in China I travelled to a number of cities and visited several remote villages to meet and observe a variety of native people and learn about their lifestyles, all the while comparing this information to my own life back home in rural upstate New York. What I found was that although many Chinese people live a completely different lifestyle than any American could imagine, they are surprisingly similar to us and I found I could relate to this unfamiliar culture very easily. The Chinese may have extremely different values, beliefs, and traditions from Americans, but deep down I found we are all very much the same. People around the world maintain three very valuable connections: with nature, with others, and within ourselves. My observations during my trip to China have led me to believe that innate human nature prevails despite individual backgrounds, ethnicity, and cultural experiences.

Keywords: autoethnography, China, cultural connections, innate human nature, multiple perspectives

I may only have spent one week in China, but in that time I realized that the ways in which people connect are surprisingly similar, even in a country halfway around the world. China was a place so different from my sheltered hometown, with people of such a different background, yet I could not help but find similarities again and again between our lives and theirs. I found it hard to believe that I could see a resemblance of myself in people with a story so different from my own, but I suppose that this speaks

volumes about human nature—despite our desire for individuality, we are all human.

Many people have asked me, upon my return from the trip, whether I went to see the Great Wall of China, the Terra Cotta Army, and a number of other classic Chinese sites. However, I tell them that this simply was not that kind of trip. Two of my FYP professors, Dr. Sidney Sondergard and Dr. Pedro Ponce, took four other students and myself to see the real China, and while it may not have been as iconic or pretty, I think the experience was much more valuable than the typical tourist locales that one would expect to find in a foreign country. By far the most memorable places we visited were the mountain villages in Guizhou province. These tiny rural towns contained the real lives of real people and their way of life truly resonates with me. In the simple lives of the minority people I could see my little hometown of Chazy. Although we have rural life in common, I would never have thought that the connection would go any further than that fact. After all, there were no stores, no restaurants—seemingly almost no businesses at all. Not only did the people lack all the usual American forms of convenience and entertainment, but they did not even appear to have real stoves to cook on, and they used outhouses rather than Western bathrooms. These aspects of village life probably seem unthinkable to most Americans, yet for the villagers this was reality.

The Miao people were isolated in their country villages, forcing them to live very simply, yet it was easy to see that they had found happiness there. Everyone was smiling, the town was clean, and though the women we visited were hard at work making brightly colored shoes to sell or wear, they sat together and talked happily. I realized, looking at them, that they did not let their isolation get in the way of their happiness, and this was the same attitude I have always kept growing up in a small town. After all, a smaller population allows closer friendships and a sense of community, and both of these aspects of country life were amazingly apparent in the Miao villages.

My graduating class included thirty-eight students, and almost all of us started at Chazy Central Rural School in kindergarten. Some of us even attended preschool together. This means that we spent 14 years growing up with one another, and while someone

from a different background might consider my situation claustrophobic and depressing, I always saw the benefits of such a close-knit community. I grew up with my friends and classmates, and this bond made us so close that all thirty-eight of us still keep up weekly contact with each other. Looking at the toddlers and older children of the Miao villages, I knew that their experience would be the same. A city person might have pitied them this closeness, but I did not. I knew the close relationships they formed would have an incredible impact on their lives and provide them with lasting friendships. For me, that makes up for the remote location of their mountain home.

Of all the sights we saw during our time with the villagers, the one that stood out the most in my mind was the music and dance performance we witnessed at the second Miao village. Growing up, I participated yearly in a local theatre group, Chazy Music Theatre, or CMT. I started getting involved with CMT in fourth grade and stuck with it until senior year, so it is safe to say that this was a big part of my childhood and high school experience. Due to my small class size, I never had what one would consider a diverse group of friends, so the artistic, unique people I met during CMT season had a huge influence in my life. It wasn't just meeting these new people that made the experience different; the theatre itself brought us together. Something about standing for hours around the old grand piano in our auditorium while we practiced a musical number again and again simply united everyone in our common goal. When show week came, we shared everything from laughter to makeup sponges (and, of course, the annual cough/stomach bug that added to the "fun" of frantic last-minute practice). I always found that, although I was forced to spend the majority of each day those last two weeks with the same people, when the curtain dropped at the end of the final performance and all of us actors and actresses went home, I felt strangely lost without the constant presence of my CMT friends.

Watching the villagers in Guizhou province, I had a feeling that their experience was much the same. As the women twirled around in unison, I could imagine the long hours of practice they had endured in order to accomplish the unity of their dance. The friendships between the people were obvious, despite the language

barrier, and it seemed to me that the music and dance helped to form this connection. This was what made me realize the reason behind my bond with my old theatre-mates. Music has a certain way of bringing people together, no matter what culture or background a person comes from. The entire experience made me feel very grateful for all the years I have dedicated to theatre and musical performance, because I suddenly saw what my life could have been missing without the help of this pursuit.

Looking back, I can see that the Miao village was not the only place where I witness how music helps people connect. Our night at the theatre in Chengdu was another example of traditional Chinese culture, and while the little shows and the style of dancing was quite different from a Western performance, I could once again see the similarities. The other world into which theatre transports both performers and audience is the same. Costumes may be wildly diverse; dance moves unlike, but the idea behind the concept is still there.

Another part of the trip that particularly stands out in my mind was our morning of Qi Gong in the People's Park of Chendu. Once again, this activity was accompanied by music, and illustrated the unity I witnessed throughout our time in China. The atmosphere in the People's Park was incredibly bright and friendly; it was one of the locations where people seemed completely uninhibited when it came to filming us, taking our pictures, and clearly talking about us in our presence, though of course we had no idea what they were saying. Whether this openness was an effect of the calming Qi Gong exercises or simply the attitude of the sort of person that attended such events in the park I do not know, but this was certainly the happiest spot we visited during our travels.

I found myself reminded of my own experiences with group exercise, from the Zumba class I attended during senior year to all the mandatory hours of phys-ed from kindergarten through high school. Even though the physical effort and mental concentration of such activities can be exhausting, there was a certain feeling of connection with the people around me. Perhaps this was simply because we were all going through the same pain, but after participating in Qi Gong I think there is more to the phenomenon. The unity of the movements creates such a sense of oneness; it was im-

possible not to feel a connection with those around me. Qi Gong is already a calming, grounding form of exercise and meditation, but performing it with others gives it the social aspect that made the experience so extraordinary. In a country with so many people, it is impressive that groups like this one could find a way to establish meaningful relationships with strangers, and I certainly admired their dedication to the ancient Chinese practice.

I could see the difference between Chinese connections and American connections just by quietly observing my surroundings. Particularly in Chengdu, the people were either incredibly friendly or simply had no shame in staring at us foreigners. Some passerby would come up to our group and just stand there taking us in before walking away, and countless people got out their cameras to take pictures of us without seeming the least bit embarrassed or shy. I thought that this was very forward of them, but then I realized that this was probably perfectly acceptable behavior in China. The people already had such a connection with one another, they most likely did not find it at all strange to openly observe outsiders and I doubt they even thought that it might make us uncomfortable. Not surprisingly, the friendliest and most shameless onlookers were to be found in the People's Park where the Qi Gong group was meeting. As I concluded, the sort of person that participates in Qi Gong is also the sort of person that connects to strangers easily, so they were the least ashamed of coming right up to speak with us and take pictures. The atmosphere was already so open and friendly that it really did not seem so odd to be addressed as acquaintances by people we had never seen before.

I had the impression that although the people of Chengdu were incredibly sociable and pleasant to us foreigners, there was a difference between their interactions with us and their interactions with one another. I noticed the same thing with all three of our tour guides. Due to the language barrier, I could not tell exactly what the locals said to one another, or what the tour guides discussed with the bus drivers, but there was an unmistakable sense of amity, almost brotherhood, between the Chinese people that I have never witnessed before among unrelated citizens. I do not know if it was simply the presence of foreigners that brought out this quality, or if there is usually this tone in everyday conversation, but

I was very impressed by the atmosphere of community. It was as though something in the lives of the Chinese brought them together in a way a foreigner could never understand.

Overall I couldn't help but notice that the people in China seemed to put an emphasis on connecting with one another. It made me think about my own experiences with others, and I could definitely see a parallel. The music and dance reminded me of my childhood relationships, but there was one other aspect of the Miao and Shui villages that sheds a new light on more recent relationships. As I have gotten older I have often considered the difference between choice and fate, since relying on either one really changes the way one lives their life. As our guide Shao Fu began to relay to us some of the village traditions, it struck me how much the Miao and Shui people, though in close proximity to one another, differed in their views of destiny. After visiting the villages, though, I began to think that people could most likely find happiness no matter what their beliefs are on the difference between choice and fate.

The first tradition Shao Fu told us about was the Sister's Meal Festival of the Miao people. Upon returning home, I was intrigued by the festival and did a little more research. During this festival, a sort of Chinese Valentine's Day, the young marriageable girls of the village harvest rice and dye it a variety of colors such as pink, white, and blue. They put in the bottom of rice bowls a certain object and prepare the bowls as gifts. A boy who is interested in the girl dances for her, and she selects one of the rice bowls depending how she feels about him. If the boy gets chopsticks, he is in luck, because she would like to marry him. If he gets a chili, however, he knows to leave her alone ("Sisters Meal Festival" 1). Because so many marriages begin this way, it is easy to conclude that the Miao people have a strong belief in choice when it comes to making life-changing decisions.

While we stood in one of the Miao people's houses watching the women work, our group was also told that men pick the women they like based on the clothing they wear. If a woman's clothing is especially beautiful in its embroidery, he will know that she would make a good wife and provide proper clothing for the family. Once again, this is a choice based on the person's opinions. However, it seemed that the women get to make the final decision since the

boys only get to pick from whom they will ask for rice. It was particularly noteworthy that the girls get to make the choice of whom they will marry—not many cultures would allow such a thing. The way the women aggressively forced upon us their wares in the town square also made it apparent that these female villagers were used to governing their own fates. They had no fear of grabbing our sleeves, waving bracelets in our faces, or shouting at us. The Miao people clearly believe in taking fate into their own hands, whether regarding marriage or simply making a living.

By contrast, what we were told about the Shui people painted a completely different picture. Although I heard no in-depth descriptions at the time on their traditions regarding marriage, what I did hear made me believe that this culture relied much more on fate than their neighboring minority group. Standing around the wide, fenced-in circle in the Shui village containing the purple “dancing grass,” our guide informed us that when a couple wishes to marry, they come to the grass and if it dances for them, they have a good match. If it does not dance, then the match is considered unfavorable. An outsider might consider the choice of a spouse quite a big decision to leave up to a plant, but I simply regard this as proof of their acceptance of fate. The Shui people also completely ignored our presence in the village—they did not take our visit as an occasion to sell goods or interact with foreigners. Again, they seemed to view opportunity as something that should only be dealt with if it comes to them, not the other way around.

After considering the fate-choice difference between the two minority groups, I did a bit of research on the other customs of the Shui people to see whether this belief in relying on destiny applied to other villages besides the one we visited. I was surprised to see that their other customs regarding marriage did, in fact, follow this same way of thought. For instance, the groom’s family will only present a piglet gift to the bride’s family on a day that has been deemed auspicious, and the families will go out of their way to make the wedding in the autumn or winter because “it is considered a taboo to have thunder or change of weather on the wedding day” (“Shui Minority” 2). There is an obvious fear that pressing any sort of luck could ruin the new couple’s fate together.

Here in America, I think we have been encouraged to take fate into our own hands, and I can see why this would be the popular opinion. However, I can also see the merit of the Shui people's way of life. By giving in to destiny, a difficult choice or situation in life can become much easier to accept. With our stressful, demanding way of life, I think all Americans could benefit from a little letting go. As I sat on the bus, I considered this new philosophy, and while I may not follow it all the time, I think it will be helpful when I am feeling overly stressed or anxious. Revelations like this are the most valuable thing I could have taken from China: something I could never have come across without being immersed in a foreign culture.

The bonds between the Chinese people were the most obvious connections I noticed; yet I could see that there were other, more subtle connections in the foundations of Chinese life. Nature seems to play a large role for the citizens of China, particularly in the remote areas but also for those leading a city life. For instance, two of the villages we visited had natural phenomena on display, both pertaining to strange rock formations in their mountain setting. The villagers were incredibly proud of these sites and even had little shrines dedicated to them. The first rock had characters fossilized in it which read "long live the Chinese communist party," which is strange since the fossils must have formed hundreds of thousands of years ago. Whether or not the phenomenon is genuine I do not know, but the most important thing I took from this site was not the amazing rock itself, but the pride of the villagers who lived near it. They had a beautiful mountain pathway leading to the rock and elaborate bridges constructed across the river on which the site stood. It was clear how much this feat of nature meant to them, and understandably so. If one can believe that nature has enough of a connection to humanity to predict a government system thousands of years before any governments even exist, then there would be no end to the wonder of nature.

Perhaps living in the country with a backyard leading into the largest Macintosh orchard in the world is the reason for my early love of nature, or perhaps I was just born that way, but I have always felt a strong connection towards the environment. Hiking, walking in the apple orchard, watering my mother's garden and playing in

the grass were all favorite pastimes of my childhood. I simply felt at peace when connecting with nature, so I could truly relate to the way the villagers love their land and appreciate the gifts it provides. Many people take the environment for granted and would rather spend time in a cushy building than outdoors, but I have always seen the beauty in spending time with the natural world. It made me happy to see that so many Chinese people were so in touch with their surroundings, and once again I felt a common bond between myself and these villagers despite our wildly different backgrounds and ways of life. However, while I noticed many parallels between Chinese culture and my own when it comes to connecting with their environment and with others, the same cannot necessarily be said for how the Chinese connect to the self.

This first became apparent to me during my visit to the Chengdu University of Traditional Chinese Medicine. Aside from my shock that we were visiting a hospital and not, in fact, a university in the American sense of the word, my first impression of the place was that it was frightening, dirty, and just disturbing. I could hardly believe that we were allowed to enter the hospital's pharmacy at all—certainly we would have contaminated the medicine by American standards, but since the treatments were mostly made up of ground up bark and plants, it likely was not sterile in the first place.

As we toured several wings of the hospital, it became glaringly obvious that cleanliness simply isn't an issue when it comes to traditional Chinese medical treatments. The kinds of therapy the patients were receiving ranged from massage to acupuncture to "cupping," none of which a patient would undergo at a typical American hospital. The Chinese view on healing clearly concentrates more on attitude (we learned that the medicines are mostly a placebo, designed to improve the patients' frame of mind and therefore their overall health) than a sterile environment and scientific treatment.

I found the hospital to be a troubling experience, yet the people who were getting treated did not seem worried. I realized that their mindset is simply far different from my own in this particular field. The Chinese base their healing in their own attitudes and mental health; they focus on finding balance rather than a scientific cure. Although this is completely unlike the American philosophy, I can hardly deny it seems to be working—no one looked like they

were terribly unhappy or suffering from neglect. Connecting to the self was simply the most important step towards health. Once again, I believe that us Americans could learn a thing or two from a radically different Chinese belief. While I still prefer my hospitals clean and with ceilings, I have observed from our experience at the Chengdu University that a better mindset can definitely be as effective a painkiller as a few Tylenol, and probably has the potential to speed healing and prevent disease. If patients in the United States could learn to have a positive state of mind, it could improve health and quality of life. This was yet another revelation that came about from an unexpected source, and I must admit that it surprised me. I was still in shock when we first exited the hospital, but after much contemplation, I realized what a valuable lesson I had learned during my visit.

During our tour of the Daoist and Buddhist temples in Chengdu we passed through a number of buildings which contained large cases housing different deities, including the classic Buddha along with some other less known religious figures. I was surprised to see how many people came in from the street to kneel before the statues, praying in what looked like a very uncomfortable position for several minutes before standing abruptly and leaving. The presence of tourists and vendors did not appear to disturb them; in fact, they looked like they were in an entirely different place than we were altogether. They were clearly just average passerby, dressed in street clothes and carrying their shopping bags with them. Yet they took the time out of their busy day to spend a few minutes devoted to meditation and prayer. Although there are, of course, a large number of Americans who are strong believers in religion and take time for worship, this experience surprised me because the people came into the temples on their own time, rather than dragging themselves to the every-Sunday service that many Americans attend. These worshippers came when they saw fit, meaning that they had to take the initiative to pray.

I personally have never been particularly religious, but I find the subject fascinating and have always liked to observe how people connect to their religion. The conclusion I came to after seeing the Chengdu temples was the same I came to after seeing the hospital. Above all, importance is placed on connecting to oneself.

Meditation and prayer appeared to be a very personal experience, and the worshippers seemed very calm and confident while kneeling before the deities in the cases. Though they were, in theory, praying to a separate being, the god, in truth they were very much connecting to their own thoughts, feelings, and emotions. This was just another example of how self-connection seemed to add balance to the lives of the Chinese, even through what we might consider an unconventional medium.

Overall, I saw that the Chinese have a culture based on connections: connections with one another, with religion, with nature, and with the self. So many traditions are based around such connections, which are simplistic yet incredibly profound. As an American teenager I understandably have many connections with others, yet the majority of these are through cell phones, Facebook, and other forms of technology that make relationships so much more complicated than the relationships I witnessed in China. Their bonds were not complex, but they created a powerful base for many aspects of Chinese culture.

I believe that any society can learn something from other societies that are radically different because no system is perfect. This is why I have taken some of the philosophies we encountered and compared them with my own way of life. I feel that the trip has given me reason to take a second look at things, view issues from multiple perspectives, and consider alternatives to the normal American way of thinking. These differences between our culture and theirs were enlightening, yet the similarities also made me see my own world in a changed way. It is hard to believe that in a place so far from home, at heart most humans are essentially the same. We all crave social interaction, yet for balance and health we require a strong connection with the self. Lastly, we have an inherent need to connect with nature, perhaps because nature contains our very roots. I suppose human nature really does apply to everyone, and it is truly amazing that this simple concept connects people across continents, languages, and cultures, even in the most surprising of places.

Bibliography

“Shui Minority.” *Chinese Culture, China Highlights*. Web. 11 Jan. 2012. <<http://www.chinahighlights.com/travelguide/nationality/shui.htm>>.

“Sisters Meals Festival.” *Chinese Culture, China Highlights*. Web. 11 Jan. 2012. <<http://www.chinahighlights.com/festivals/sisters-meals-festival.htm>>.

Romeo and Juliet:

Interpreting the Language of Shakespeare's Play

Abstract: This edition of Act 3, Scene 1 of *Romeo and Juliet* focuses on understanding and interpreting the language of Shakespeare's play, using references to other editions and information to enhance the meaning of the text as a whole. Side-by-side with the original text are notations and which break down the lines and get at the real meaning of the scene. Notations from other editions help explain archaic terms and phrases, and also include historical and social references which contribute to the action onstage. Posed in the notations there are also discussion questions and ideas concerning the characters in the scene, and how they may be interpreted onstage. Overall, this edition is designed to both explain and educate, looking at deeper meaning to better understand the play's function as a whole.

Keywords: Shakespeare; Romeo and Juliet; original practices; adaptation; dramaturgy.

Welcome to my edition of *Romeo and Juliet*, and thank you for reading. I'd like for you to get started, but let me delay you very briefly with a few notes and tips for reading. In the most straightforward of terms, the left side of the page is the text of the play, the right side my own notations. The text itself was taken initially from the online MIT Shakespeare base, which has the full text of almost every Shakespearean play and long poem. To this I made only minor changes in grammar and spelling, based partly on *The New Cambridge Shakespeare Romeo and Juliet*, and partly on my own aesthetic.

It is my firm belief that the text should be something different to each and every person, and so actors and readers alike should feel free to take liberties with contractions, pauses, and so on. In many ways, this was the custom for Shakespeare and his contemporaries, and so I find it fitting to apply it to my project now. The left side of the page also has footnote notations from four different editions of the text: *The New Cambridge Shakespeare*, *The Oxford Shakespeare*, *Signet Classics*, and *Folger Shakespeare Library*. They are marked CS, OS, SIG, and FOL, respectively. These are used to clarify terms and phrases in the text, as well as provide some cultural and historical information. Occasionally, I have added in my own notations to clarify a subject I felt the editions didn't address, and which didn't fit into my notations on the right side of the page. These are marked with CR.

The right side of the page consists of my notations. Follow these with the line numbers on the right hand side of the text. The vast majority of these involve line meanings---that is, not direct paraphrases, but what the character is trying to communicate, and what they are trying to get from the other characters in the scene. Occasionally I found that paraphrasing brought out the meaning in a stronger or more eloquent way, and these phrases are italicized. Also included is background information of some kind: historical, cultural, or social. They also include tips for acting and reading, with focuses sometimes on line meter and rhythm, sometimes

characterization, and sometimes on discussion questions or ideas. Overall, they are designed to provide new information and allow the reader to engage with the story on a deeper and more personal level. And of course, because no one person can have all the answers, I did occasionally cite other sources in these notations. The full citations for these sources are included in my bibliography.

With my edition of the play, I hoped to provide an easily-accessible text that would not only allow readers to understand the story, but actively engage with it, and broaden their understanding of the play as a whole. I hope that it stands up to muff, and please, more than anything, enjoy.

Act 3, Scene 1
Verona, a public place

Enter Mercutio, Benvolio, and Men

BENVOLIO

I pray thee, good Mercutio, let's retire:
The day is hot, the Capels are abroad,
And if we meet we shall not scape a brawl;
For now, these hot days, is the mad blood stirring

MERCUTIO

Thou art like one of those fellows that, when he 5
enters the confines of a tavern, claps me his sword
upon the table and says 'God send me no need¹ of
thee!'; and by the operation² of the second cup
draws him on the drawer,³ when indeed there is
no need. 10

1 Claps me, places loudly, the action of a braggart and a subtle invitation to fight CS; claps, FOL

2 Operation, influence, effect CS

3 Drawer, drawer of the beer, tapster, bartender CS; on the waiter
SIG

3.1 Shakespearean audiences had little knowledge of Italy: Shakespeare himself had never been there, and so their perceptions of the country depended on news, trade, and mostly rumor. In particular, the country was associated with Catholicism, a highly unpopular and recently banned religion in Elizabethan England. As such, Italians were thought to be fundamentally different from the English in manners of social practice, and most importantly, sexual impropriety. Italy was viewed as a violent country of wild abandon and loose morals with all emotions at the boil. As such, it seems fitting that Shakespeare set this play - which has to do more than anything with love and violence - within the city of Verona (Callaghan).

1-4 Benvolio asks Mercutio to go back inside, away from this public area (likely a town square). It's the middle of July, the hottest part of summer, and everyone is hot and cranky. There's no way they could see members of the Capulet family in the square and not try to fight with them. The Prince has recently banned street brawls and fighting in public, and engaging the Capulets would have dire consequences. Keep in consideration when *Romeo and Juliet* was first performed, there were wild class riots in the streets of London, and the queen had recently enacted a similar ban on public brawls. (Fitter) Shakespeare's audience would have seen this action onstage, and immediately associated it with their everyday lives.

5-10 Imagine one of those guys who saunters into a bar, and throws his sword on the table, yelling out "I don't need you tonight!," and two drinks in he's ready to run through the bartender for no reason at all.

BENVOLIO

Am I like such a fellow?

MERCUTIO

Come, come, thou art as hot a Jack in thy mood⁴ as any in Italy, and as soon moved to be moody, and as soon moody to be moved⁵.

BENVOLIO

And what to?⁶ 15

MERCUTIO

Nay, an there were two such, we should have none shortly, for one would kill the other.
Thou? why, thou wilt quarrel with a man that hath a hair more, or a hair less, in his beard, than thou hast: thou wilt quarrel with a man for cracking nuts, having no other reason but because thou hast hazel eyes. What eye but such an eye would spy out such a quarrel? Thy head is as full of quarrels as an egg is full of meat, and yet thy head hath been beaten as addle as an egg for quarrelling: thou hast quarrelled with a man for coughing in the street, because he hath wakened thy dog that hath lain asleep in the sun. Didst thou not fall out with a tailor for wearing his new doublet⁷ before Easter? with another, for tying his new shoes with old⁸ riband? and yet thou wilt tutor me from quarrelling!⁹ 20
25
30

4 Mood, anger OS; moved, provoked, angered CS
5 Moved to be moody, quick-tempered SIG; soon provoked to be angry and as irritable FOL
6 Mercutio intentionally takes his 'to' as 'two' FOL
7 Doublet, jacket SIG
8 New clothes would come out each season; before Easter is Lent, so presumably the clothes were too flashy to be worn out CS
9 Tutor me from quarrelling, teach me not to quarrel FOL

11 Benvolio realizes Mercutio is being flamboyantly sarcastic; any amount of emphasis on the “I” in the line makes that clear.

12-14 Mercutio continues teasing Benvolio, saying he’s as quick to be provoked to anger as he is angry to be provoked

15 And so what?

16-17 If there were two of you, there would soon be none because you would kill one another.

18-26 You’ll fight with a man because he has more hair than you, you’ll fight because he has less hair than you; you’ll fight a man for eating hazelnuts, since it insults your hazel eyes. Your head is as full as an egg of reasons to fight, and your head has been beaten like a scrambled egg because of it.

27-33 Mercutio teases Benvolio, asking if it’s true that he got in a fight with a tailor for debuting his flashy new clothes out during the somber season of Lent, and another one for tying his new shoes with old ribbon. And yet, he has the audacity to scold Mercutio for his desire to fight. Mercutio is maybe teasing Benvolio for adhering too sharply to rules of custom and morality. Mercutio’s language is almost always extravagant and convoluted. This reflects, in a way, an aspect of his character that he is so openly over-the-top and dramatic.

BENVOLIO

An I were so apt to quarrel as thou art, any
man should buy the fee-simple¹⁰ of my
life for an hour and a quarter¹¹. 35

MERCUTIO

The fee-simple! O simple!¹²
Enter Tybalt, Petruccio, and Men

BENVOLIO

By my head, here come the Capulets.

MERCUTIO

By my heel, I care not.¹³

TYBALT

Follow me close, for I will speak to them. 40
Gentlemen, good e'en, a word with one of
you.¹⁴

MERCUTIO

And but one word with one of us? couple it
with something; make it a word and a blow.

TYBALT

You shall find me apt enough to that, sir, 45
an you will give me occasion.¹⁵

10 Fee-simple, absolute possessions CS; Estate belonging to its owner and heirs forever OS; Title to full ownership FOL

11 Hour an a quarter, the life expectancy of one with Mercutio's temper for quarreling FOL

12 Simple, weak-minded, or stupid; play on simple as absolute CS; low price OS

13 Derogatory CS; By my head, a mild swear on Benvolios life FOL

14 E'en, salutation, can be used anytime in the afternoon OS

15 An, if; give us occasion, give us cause OS

34-36 Benvolio retorts that if he was as quarrelsome as Mercutio, he should sell his estate for an hour and a quarter to someone, since he would likely be killed in that time.

36 The pun on ‘simple’ works two-fold for Mercutio; he gently insults Benvolio by calling him dumb, but also continues the monetary meaning of simple as low-priced, referring to the cost of Benvolio’s life.

37 Also, “by my life”, or “on my life” a mild oath by Benvolio.

38 I don’t give a shit.

40-42 Tybalt’s first line is spoken to his men accompanying him. Tybalt is coming looking for Romeo to rough him up, entering essentially, with a gang. He begins the exchange with Mercutio quite cordially: he has no issue with Mercutio and Benvolio. He knows they’re friends with Romeo, but has no reason or desire to fight them.

43-45 Mercutio is ready to fight, and is in fact attempting to provoke Tybalt and his men into striking first, and taking the blame for the brawl. Tybalt is striding in with backup: he is deliberately trying to intimidate someone, and even though he has no fight with Romeo, his presence alone could be seen by Mercutio as an invitation to brawl.

45-46 Tybalt assures Mercutio that given a good reason, he will not hesitate to strike.

MERCUTIO

Could you not take some occasion without giving?

TYBALT

Mercutio, thou consortest with Romeo 49

MERCUTIO

Consort! what, dost thou make us 50
minstrels? An thou make minstrels of ¹⁶us,
look to hear nothing but discords. Here's my
fiddlestick, here's that ¹⁷shall make you dance.
'Zounds, consort!¹⁸

BENVOLIO

We talk here in the public haunt¹⁹ of men: 55
Either withdraw unto some private place,
Or reason coldly of your grievances,
Or else depart; here all eyes gaze on us.

MERCUTIO

Men's eyes were made to look, and let them
gaze; I will not budge for no man's 60
pleasure, I.
Enter Romeo

TYBALT

Well, peace be with you, sir, here comes my
man

16 Mercutio intentionally misunderstanding Tybalt; consort, as-
sociate, but also to play music together OS

17 Fiddlesticks, rapier, sword FOL

18 Zounds, By god's wounds, a swear SIG

19 Haunt, meeting place FOL

49 Couldn't you still fight me without a reason?

Mercutio is a friend and ally of Romeo's, and that fact alone is a reason for Tybalt to fight Mercutio

50-54 Mercutio intentionally misunderstands Tybalt 'consortest', taking it to mean a group of minstrels, or traveling musicians. If indeed they are minstrels Tybalt will hear nothing but discordant music from them. 'Fiddlestick' perhaps refers to Mercutio's sword, which he might draw here in an attempt to intimidate Tybalt and make him dance to avoid getting hit. Minstrels were also considered cheap musicians, or vagabonds, since they played on the street, making Tybalt's comment an insult to Mercutio and Romeo's class status. There is also a sexual connotation to 'consort', with Tybalt suggesting homoeroticism between the men

55-58 Benvolio is trying to keep the peace here, perhaps by actually physically stepping between Tybalt and Mercutio.

59-61 Mercutio refuses to stand down, not caring if people watch him becomes engaged in a fight. Mercutio is the Prince's relative: he is friends with Romeo and Benvolio, who are Montagues, but is otherwise reasonably neutral in the family feud. Likewise, as the Prince's cousin it is possible that he would not face such harsh penalty for the law if he were to engage in conflict on the street

62 Seeing Romeo approach, Tybalt leaves Mercutio and Benvolio to confront him

MERCUTIO

But I'll be hanged, sir, if he wear your livery.²⁰
Marry, go before to field, he'll be your follower;²¹ 65
Your worship in that sense may call him 'man.'

TYBALT

Romeo, the love I bear thee can afford²²
No better term than this: thou art a villain.²³

ROMEO

Tybalt, the reason that I have to love thee 70
Doth much excuse the appertaining rage²⁴
To such a greeting. Villain am I none;
Therefore farewell; I see thou knowest me not.

TYBALT

Boy, this shall not excuse the injuries²⁵
That thou hast done me, therefore turn 75
and draw.

20 Livery, servant's uniform SIG
21 Go before the field, if you lead the way to the field of combat OS; dueling field SIG
22 Q1 and other editions use 'hate', suggesting Tybalt's sarcasm OS
23 Villain, an insult; low born peasant, scoundrel OS; low fellow SIG
24 Appertaining , appropriate SIG
25 Boy, used in contempt to insult, condescending OS

64-66 I'd rather die than see him your servant. But go ahead and start something, he'll follow you there; Mercutio intentionally misunderstands Tybalt's 'man', taking it to mean his servant, but then notes if he wants to fight then Romeo will be his man.

68-69 Villain can refer to a servant, or as an insult which demeans Romeo's birth and moral character. In many of the quarto editions of the play, 'love' is replaced with the word 'hate'.

70-74 Romeo tries his best to avoid a conflict. He recognizes Tybalt's insult, and the fact that he should be enraged by it, but declines to fight, since he is now Tybalt's cousin.

74-76 Tybalt goads Romeo into fighting, calling him 'boy', a condescending term meant to insult him further and incense him into a fight.

ROMEO

I do protest I never injured thee,
But love thee better than thou canst devise,²⁶
Till thou shalt know the reason of my love;
And so, good Capulet, which name I tender²⁷ 80
As dearly as my own, be satisfied.

MERCUTIO

O calm, dishonourable, vile submission!
Alla stoccata carries it away. (Draws)²⁸
Tybalt, you rat-catcher, will you walk?²⁹

TYBALT

What wouldst thou have with me? 85

MERCUTIO

Good king of Cats, nothing but one of your
nine lives that I mean to make bold with, and
as you shall use me hereafter, dry-beat the rest
of the eight³⁰. Will you pluck your sword out
of his pilcher³¹ by the ears? Make haste, 90
lest mine be about your ears ere it be out.

TYBALT

I am for you. (Drawing)

26 Devise, imagine SIG; Think out, FOL

27 Tender, value SIG; Regard, FOL

28 Alla stoccata, at the thrust, fencing term CS; duelist a la mode wins the day OS; contemptuous nickname for Mercutio, SIG

29 Walk, could be walk away, as in leave the fight, or a challenge to fight: changing the stage direction of him drawing his sword could make either option viable OS; walk, step aside SIG

30 Depending how the fight goes, he'll beat the rest of his lives as well CS; dry-beat, thrash SIG; use, treat FOL

31 Scabbard, SIG; Contemptuous term; pilch, leather garmet, here scabbard FOL

77-81 Romeo attempts to calm Tybalt and avoid fighting with him by proclaiming his affection for the Capulets, since he is now married to one.

82 Mercutio is outraged at Romeo's refusal to fight and challenges Tybalt for him. His line 'rat-catcher' starts a long metaphor in which he continuously compares Tybalt to a cat. The comparisons to Tybalt as a cat allude to Reynard the Fox, the hero in series of medieval versified animal tales, much in the same vein as Aesop's Fables. In these stories, the king of cats was named Tybalt or Tybert (Callaghan).

86-91 Mercutio assures Tybalt that however he is after the fight ("as you shall use me hereafter"), he will still beat the rest of Tybalt's eight lives. He asks if he will draw, as it's likely he will strike before Tybalt's sword is even out.

92 Tybalt accepts Mercutio's invitation to strike.

ROMEO

Gentle Mercutio, put thy rapier up.³²

MERCUTIO

Come, sir, your passado.³³

(They fight)

ROMEO

Draw, Benvolio; beat down their weapons. 95

Gentlemen, for shame, forbear this outrage!

Tybalt, Mercutio, the prince expressly hath

Forbid this bandying in Verona streets

(Romeo steps between them)

Hold, Tybalt! Good Mercutio!

(Tybalt under Romeo's arm runs Mercutio through)

Away Tybalt *(with his men)*³⁴

MERCUTIO

I am hurt 100

A plague a³⁵ both houses! I am sped³⁶.

Is he gone and hath nothing?³⁷

BENVOLIO

What, art thou hurt?

32 Sword, always on a man CS

33 Passado, forward thrust with a sword OS; lunge SIG

34 Q2 prints 'Away' as a line spoken by one of Tybalt's men, Petruccio. However, Shakespeare infrequently uses 'Away' for 'Exit', and many editions change it simply to 'Exeunt' CS

35 A, on SIG

36 Sped, spent, wounded SIG

37 Hath nothing, suffered no wound FOL

93 Romeo is cautioning Mercutio to prepare to fight, since Tybalt has just drawn his sword.

94 Mercutio is perhaps taunting Tybalt here, goading him in to fight dirty by mocking his traditional and trained fencing style.

95-99 Romeo calls Benvolio to draw his sword, and beat down the weapons of the two men reminding them that what they're doing is illegal. The line "Away Tybalt" was originally printed in the quarto as a line spoken by Petrucchio, one of Tybalt's men. However, in subsequent editions this has been changed to an Exeunt. Depending on the number of actors and the director, both choices could be viable for a production.

100-102 Mercutio, injured and bleeding, curses the houses of Capulet and Montague, and cries out in anger that Tybalt is "gone and hath nothing". Perhaps he is anguished and in pain, bitter that he lost, or is trying to provoke Romeo into exacting revenge.

MERCUTIO

Ay, ay, a scratch, a scratch marry; 'tis enough.
Where is my page? Go, villain³⁸, fetch a 105
surgeon
Exit Page

ROMEO

Courage, man, the hurt cannot be much.

MERCUTIO

No, 'tis not so deep as a well, nor so wide as a
church-door; but 'tis enough, 'twill serve. Ask 110
for me to-morrow, and you shall find me
a grave man. I am peppered, I warrant, for
this world. A plague a' both your houses!
'Zounds, a dog, a rat, a mouse, a cat, to scratch
a man to death! a braggart, a rogue, a villain,
that fights by the book of arithmetic. 115
Why the devil came you between us? I was
hurt under your arm.

ROMEO

I thought all for the best.

MERCUTIO

Help me into some house, Benvolio,
Or I shall faint. A plague a' both your houses! 120
They have made worms' meat of me. I have it,
And soundly too. Your houses!
Exeunt Mercutio and Benvolio

38 Villain, servant SIG

108-112 Mercutio makes metaphors for his wounds, saying it's not as deep as a well or as wide as a church door, but enough to do mortal harm. He realizes this injury could kill him, and refers to himself as a man both somber and ready for the grave.

113-117 He likens Tybalt to an animal, and marvels that he was able to scratch a man to death. He asks Romeo why he came between him and Tybalt, perhaps suggesting that Romeo's interference threw him off.

119-122 Mercutio asks for help to get inside to seek assistance, realizing how serious his wound is. He blames the feuding houses for turning him into worms' meat, a dead body. Although Mercutio curses both the Montagues and the Capulets, he was the one who provoked Tybalt into the fight. Whose fault then, was Mercutio's death?

ROMEO

This gentleman, the Prince's near ally ,
My very friend, hath got his mortal hurt
In my behalf; my reputation stained 125
With Tybalt's slander —Tybalt, that an hour
Hath been my cousin . O sweet Juliet,
Thy beauty hath made me effeminate
And in my temper softened valour's steel!
Enter Benvolio

BENVOLIO

O Romeo, Romeo, brave³⁹ Mercutio is 130
dead!
That gallant spirit hath aspired⁴⁰ the clouds,
Which too untimely here did scorn the earth.

ROMEO

This day's black fate on more days doth depend;⁴¹
This but begins the woe others must end.
Enter Tybalt

BENVOLIO

Here comes the furious Tybalt back again 135

39 Brave, splendid FOL
40 Aspired, mounted up to OS; climbed to SIG
41 Waits in suspense of the future, FOL

123-129 Romeo realizes the vast consequences of his action. His friend was killed on his behalf, his own name slandered and defiled. He realizes that he has allowed his affection for Juliet cloud his judgment and his temper, and made him unwilling or unable to fight Tybalt.

130-132 Benvolio delivers the news that Mercutio is dead, his spirit untimely left his earthly body.

133-134 Romeo pauses to consider his fate. He realizes that Mercutio's death sets into motion a series of actions and reactions which will be impossible to avoid. As the Prince's cousin, Mercutio was in a unique neutral position in the family feud—his death at the hands of a Capulet does not bode well for that family. Although Romeo is a Montague, his marriage to Juliet ties him with the Capulets. Mercutio's death makes it more likely his marriage to Juliet will be exposed, and the circumstances between the families will worsen.

135 It is unclear why Tybalt returns: perhaps to fight Romeo, perhaps to see the outcome of his hit on Mercutio.

ROMEO

Alive⁴², in triumph, and Mercutio slain?
Away to heaven, respective lenity⁴³,
And fire-eyed fury be my conduct now!
Now, Tybalt, take the 'villain' back again,
That late⁴⁴ thou gavest me, for Mercutio's soul 140
Is but a little way above our heads,
Staying⁴⁵ for thine to keep him company:
Either thou, or I, or both, must go with him.

TYBALT

Thou wretched boy, that didst consort⁴⁶ him here
Shall with him hence. 145
(They fight; Tybalt falls)

BENVOLIO

Romeo, away, be gone!
The citizens are up, and Tybalt slain.
Stand not amazed, the prince will doom thee death,
If thou art taken. Hence, be gone, away!

ROMEO

O, I am fortune's fool! 150

BENVOLIO

Why dost thou stay?
Exit Romeo, Enter Citizens

42 Also seen as 'Again' in editions CS; he gan, or he has gone too OS

43 Respective; discriminating, partial OS; Considerate mildness CS; discriminating mercifulness, SIG

44 Late, recently FOL

45 Staying, waiting CS

46 Consort, associate with CS

136-143 At Tybalt's return, Romeo's consternation is transformed into rage. Furious that Tybalt is triumphant, and enraged that he allowed his friend to fight and be injured in his stead, he curses mildness, and calls upon fury to help him fight. He tells Tybalt to take back the names he called him, and taunts him with the idea that Mercutio's soul is waiting for one of theirs to keep him company.

144-145 Tybalt, equally angry now, insults Romeo and blames him for bringing Mercutio into their disagreement, and assures him he will be going the same way as Mercutio next.

145-149 Tybalt falls dead, and Benvolio starts yelling at Romeo to run: people in the square have noticed and started to cause a ruckus, and if the Prince sees him next to Tybalt's body, he will sentence him to death.

152 The Citizen in this case is often a citizen of the watch, the equivalent of a policeman in Elizabethan England.

CITIZEN

Which way ran he that killed Mercutio?
Tybalt, that murderer, which way ran he?

BENVOLIO

There lies that Tybalt.

CITIZEN

Up, sir, go with me; 155
I charge thee in the princes name, obey.
Enter Prince, old Montague, Capulet, their Wives, and all

PRINCE

Where are the vile beginners of this fray?

BENVOLIO

O noble Prince, I can discover all
The unlucky manage of this fatal brawl;
There lies the man, slain by young Romeo, 160
That slew thy kinsman, brave Mercutio

LADY CAPULET

Tybalt, my cousin! O my brother's child!
O prince! O husband! O, the blood is spilled
Of my dear kinsman. Prince, as thou art true,
For blood of ours, shed blood of Montague. 165
O cousin, cousin!

PRINCE

Benvolio, who began this bloody fray?

155 The command up suggests that Benvolio was sitting or kneeling at Tybalt's side, perhaps to see if he was really injured or dead.

148-161 Benvolio steps up to the Prince to explain what has transpired: that is, that Tybalt was killed by Romeo after he killed Mercutio. These lines are in rhyming couplets, which gives an indication as to how they may be read. Considering Benvolio is speaking to the Prince, this may be formal language reserved for high members of the court. It also sharply contrasts Lady's Capulet's anguished and uneven meter in the next speech, giving Benvolio a sense of power and control in the situation. It could also be a preamble, an announcement of sorts that he is about to start a speech to explain when he is interrupted by Lady Capulet.

161-166 This speech by Lady Capulet is highly irregular in emphasis, as well as heavily punctuated and repetitive, all unusual qualities in Shakespeare's writing. It suggests her distress at seeing Tybalt's body, and her misery at his death. The rhyme plays interestingly as well, as she begs the prince to exact revenge on the Montague family.

168-172 Benvolio explains what happened: that Romeo tried to convince Tybalt not to fight, softening him with his love of the Capulets and the measure of the law, quietly and peacefully.

BENVOLIO

Tybalt, here slain, whom Romeo's hand did slay
Romeo that spoke him fair⁴⁷, bid him bethink⁴⁸
How nice⁴⁹ the quarrel was, and urged⁵⁰ with 170
Your high⁵¹ displeasure: all this uttered
With gentle breath, calm look, knees humbly bowed,
Could not take truce with⁵² the unruly spleen⁵³
Of Tybalt deaf to peace, but that he tilts⁵⁴
With piercing steel at bold Mercutio's breast, 175
Who, all as hot, turns deadly point to point,
And with a martial scorn⁵⁵, with one hand beats
Cold death aside, and with the other sends
It back to Tybalt, whose dexterity,
Retorts it⁵⁶. Romeo he cries aloud, 180
'Hold, friends! friends, part!' and, swifter than his tongue,
His agile arm⁵⁷ beats down their fatal points,
And 'twixt them rushes; underneath whose arm
An envious⁵⁸ thrust from Tybalt hit the life
Of stout⁵⁹ Mercutio, and then Tybalt fled; 185
But by and by comes back to Romeo,
Who had but newly entertained⁶⁰ revenge,

47 Fair, politely FOL
48 Bethink, consider CS; reflect upon FOL
49 Nice, insignificant CS; senseless, trivial OS
50 Urged, mentioned SIG
51 High, refers to rank as well as gravity of the prince's displeasure OS
52 Take truce with, placate FOL
53 Spleen, hot temper OS; unruly nature SIG
54 Tilts, thrusts SIG, strikes FOL
55 Martial scorn, desire to fight, mood to fight befitting a warrior OS
56 One hand beats...retorts it, Mercutio parries Tybalt's blow, and returns one back to him CS; describing a fight with a sword and a dagger in each hand; fighters parry with the daggers in the left, thrust with swords in the right OS; retorts it, sends it back again FOL
57 Sword, FOL
58 Envious, full of enmity SIG; malicious, FOL
59 Stout, valiant FOL
60 Entertained, contemplated, SIG

173-182 However, this was not enough to stem Tybalt's thirst for violence, so much so that he fought Mercutio instead. Mercutio, just as eager to fight, stepped in to take Tybalt's blows instead, turning each of them back to Tybalt, who would strike again. Romeo stepped in between the fighters, using his own sword to beat down Tybalt and Mercutio's weapons.

183-187 Tybalt thrust his sword under Romeo's arm, and into Mercutio. Seeing what he had done, Tybalt fled. Romeo had just begun to consider revenge when Tybalt returned. Consider how Benvolio may be coloring this speech in Romeo's favor, particularly when he mentions how meek and humble Romeo was in trying to talk down Tybalt. Do you believe his version of the story? Benvolio is a Montague, and so would want his friends to appear innocent, particularly in front of the outraged Capulets. What does this say about Benvolio's character? How is he able to remain so calm and talk to the Prince, rather than cutting and running with Romeo and Tybalt's men?

And to't they go like lightning, for, ere I.

Could draw to part them, was stout Tybalt slain.
And, as he fell, did Romeo turn and fly. 190
This is the truth, or let Benvolio die.

LADY CAPULET

He is a kinsman to the Montague;
Affection⁶¹ makes him false, he speaks not true:
Some twenty of them fought in this black strife,
And all those twenty could but kill one life 195
I beg for justice, which thou, Prince, must give:
Romeo slew Tybalt, Romeo must not live.

PRINCE

Romeo slew him, he slew Mercutio;
Who now the price of his dear blood doth owe?

MONTAGUE

Not Romeo, Prince, he was Mercutio's friend; 200
His fault⁶² concludes but what the law should end⁶³,
The life of Tybalt.

61 Affection, inclination, alliance towards them FOL
62 His fault, his mistake of fighting with Tybalt OS
63 Concludes, finishes, should end OS; what should have ended FOL

188-191 Romeo and Tybalt flew at each other, and before Benvolio could move to intervene, Tybalt was killed. As he fell, Romeo ran to escape, all of which Benvolio swears on his life is true.

192-195 Lady Capulet protests, saying that since he is a cousin of Romeo's, he is lying to protect him. She accuses the Montagues of ganging up on Tybalt, for which Romeo should be put to death. This is a return of the rhyme scheme seen in Benvolio's speech previously. Again, Lady Capulet is addressing the Prince which could demand more formal language, or it could indicate the grave severity of the situation as she demands for Romeo's life to be taken.

198-199 *Romeo killed him, he killed Mercutio;
So who should be responsible for his death?*

200-202 Montague asks for Romeo to be spared, arguing that he acted in accordance to the law by killing Tybalt.

PRINCE

And for that offence

Immediately we do exile⁶⁴ him hence.

I have an interest in your hearts' proceeding:⁶⁵ 205

My blood for your rude brawls doth lie a-bleeding;⁶⁶

But I'll amerce⁶⁷ you with so strong a fine

That you shall all repent the loss of mine:

I will be deaf to pleading and excuses;

Nor tears nor prayers shall purchase out 210

abuses⁶⁸:

Therefore use none. Let Romeo hence in haste,

Else, when he is found, that hour is his last.

Bear hence this body and attend our will:⁶⁹

Mercy but murders, pardoning those that
kill⁷⁰.

64 Exile, emphasis on second syllable OS; also switches from the personal I to the royal 'we' CS

65 Heart, seat of emotion; prince has concern with reactions; seen in Q1 as 'hates' OS

66 Mercutio was the Prince's relative, therefore it is his own blood spilled in the street CS

67 Amerce, punish, penalize CS; punish by fine, SIG

68 Buy out, make amends for CS; redeem injuries OS, buy impunity for FOL

69 Attend, heed FOL; Our will, respect my decision SIG

70 By pardoning murder, it will only lead to more murders OS

203-212 For killing Tybalt, Romeo is banished. The prince also has a stake in this issue: as his kinsman, Mercutio's death means his own blood was spilled in the streets. For this, he will fine the families heavily, as payment for his loss. He cautions that he will not put up with complaints or pleading about paying the fine, since no apologies can make amends for what has happened. He says that Romeo should leave the city, and quickly, for if he's found he will be killed.

213 The Prince tells the crowd to bring in Tybalt's body, and follow the judgment that he has set down. He knows he is not being merciful, but he reasons that mercy here would allow more murders to take place and the fighting to continue. Why do you think the Prince pardoned Romeo? These families have been feuding for years, the Prince's own family was attacked in this moment, and he has banned street fighting. Yet, he is still merciful. What does that say about his character? Where is this judgment coming from?

Bibliography

- Asimov, Isaac. *Asimov's Guide to Shakespeare: The Greek, Roman, and Italian Plays*, vol. 1. Avenel Books, New York, 1978.
- Barton, John. *Playing Shakespeare*. Methuen Drama, London, 1984.
- Fitter, Chris. "The quarrel is between our masters and us their men' Romeo and Juliet, Dearth, and the London Riots." *In English Literary Renaissance* 30.2 (2000): 154-183.
- Hartley, A. J. *The Shakespearean Dramaturg: a Theoretical and Practical Guide*. Palgrave Macmillan, New York, 2005.
- Shakespeare, William. *The Tragedy of Romeo and Juliet*. In *Classic Shakespeare*, Ed J. A. Bryant Jr. Penguin Group, New York, 1986.
- Shakespeare, William. *Romeo and Juliet Texts and Contexts*. Ed. Dymrna Callaghan. Bedford/St. Martin's, Boston, 2003.
- Shakespeare, William. *The First Quarto of Romeo and Juliet*. Ed. Lukas Erne. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2007.
- Shakespeare, William. *Romeo and Juliet: The New Cambridge Shakespeare*. Ed. G. Blakemore Evans. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2003.
- Shakespeare, William. "Romeo and Juliet" *The Complete Works of William Shakespeare*. Ed. Jeremy Hylton. Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 1993
- Shakespeare, William. *Romeo and Juliet*. Ed. Jill L. Levenson. Oxford University Press, Oxford 2000
- Shakespeare, William. *Romeo and Juliet: Shakespeare*. In *Production*. Ed. James N. Loehlin. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2002.

Shakespeare, William. *The Tragedy of Romeo and Juliet: Folger Edition* Ed.
Barbara A. Mowat, Paul Werstein. *The New Folger Shakespeare
Library Pocket Books*, New York, 1992.

Van Tassel, Wesley. *Clues to Acting Shakespeare*. Skyhorse Publishing Inc, New
York, 2006.

Producing and Reprducing Representations: A Study of Maasai and Maori in Mainstream Western Media

Abstract: It is human nature to categorize and name, but at what point do such categorizations falsely portray reality? This essay analyzes colonial discourse rhetoric as it relates to popular Western online news media today. Using JanMohamed’s theory informing that colonial relationships are rooted in a Manichean allegory of cultural and racial differences, the author argues that journalism today continues to employ such differences in its portrayals of indigenous cultures. Through the lens of ‘the gaze,’ journalists select certain representations, leaving others unreported. Sixty articles were analyzed to study the representations of the Maasai of Kenya and the Māori of New Zealand. The author’s analysis concludes that the NYTimes.com and BBC.co.uk maintain some colonial language about the Other, but largely use essentializing language about the Maasai and the Māori. These stereotypical portrayals are cyclically perpetuated by cultural performances the communities perform for tourists.

Key Words: News Media, Colonial Discourse, the ‘gaze,’ Selective Articulation, Representation, Cultural Performance, Communities of Interpretation.

News media today has infiltrated into every facet of society and mediates our reality in a reciprocal way: making something, while simultaneously being made (Grossberg, Wartella & Whitney 7).¹ They are productive in that news corporations are “making money, making everyday life, making meaning, making identities, making reality, making behavior, making his-

¹ News media are the organizations and institutions that provide the public with news, or what is considered “new” information.

tory” (Grossberg, Wartella & Whitney 7). Using a cultural model of communication, the process in which the news media use social communication to produce a common culture through shared meanings is understood. In this context, culture is “synonymous with the whole way of life of a society or people” (Grossberg, Wartella & Whitney 18). Humans constantly seek to understand their environment and other cultures by describing or defining, which results in perceptions/interpretations of what a culture is from an outsiders’ point of view (Grossberg, Wartella & Whitney 18-20). In the case of Western news media, the West acts as the interpreter of cultures. Based on content analysis of two Western corporate news organizations (NYTimes.com and BBC.co.uk), it is evident that current portrayals of the Maasai of Kenya and the Maori of New Zealand, two indigenous groups in the 21st century, are based on Western dominated ideals that are both colonial and stereotypical in representation. Both types of representations are cyclically reproduced by the mediated interactions between Western and indigenous cultures, as seen through the cultural performances of the Maasai and the Maori.

The formation of indigenous representations dates back to the first contacts between two trading cultures. Over time, imperial policy was adopted by European nations to fuel the growing industrial revolution and create new markets for goods, ensuring the growth of extraction and production. Georges Balandier defined colonialism in 1963 as “the domination imposed by a foreign minority, ‘racially’ and culturally different, over a materially weaker indigenous majority in the name of racial (or ethnic) and cultural superiority” (Spurr 5-6). The power-relations between the colonizer and the colonized are determined by the difference in the level of technology and economic complexity, as well as power over knowledge production (JanMohamed 62; Spurr 6). The power-difference is created through material and discursive strategies that once established must be maintained. For this reason physical domination, conversion, ideological, representational, and administrative tactics are employed, most often creating a production system and discourse of racial difference (Spurr 6).

JanMohamed equates this colonial relationship with the Manichean allegory. The allegory is an essential opposition, based on

assumed superiority of the colonialist/observer and the inferiority of the colonized/observed, which creates racial and discursive difference: “The dominant model of power- and interest-relations in all colonial societies is the Manichean opposition between the putative superiority of the European and the supposed inferiority of the native” (JanMohamed 63). What started as racial difference transformed into a moral and metaphysical difference that “dominate[s] every facet of imperialist mentality” (JanMohamed 61). Racial and cultural difference is essential for a group to enforce or claim a position of superiority.

Much like resources taken from the colonized and managed by the colonizers, “colonialist discourse ‘commodifies’ the native subject into a stereotyped object and uses him as a ‘resource’ for colonialist function” (JanMohamed 64). By commodifying colonialist subjects, they are reduced to an exchange-value and any generic attribute can be indefinitely substituted. This removes the individuality and subjectivity of the colonized, they become generic and inter-exchangeable amongst each other. Edward Said makes this observation with Orientalism,² claiming that this exchange is reliant upon the “flexible positional superiority, which puts the Westerner in a whole series of possible relationships with the Orient without ever losing him the relative upper hand” (JanMohamed 64). In this sense the essentialized identity of the colonized justifies the superior position of the colonizer, who can maintain dominance in a number of varying circumstances (Spurr 7).

In the case of the Maasai, who are one of many indigenous groups in Kenya, they are *generalized* as pastoralists occupying semi-arid plains living in small semi-nomadic groups to accommodate herding of their cattle (sheep, cows, and goats). As cattle have significant value in Maasai culture and are greatly depended on for food, large herds are necessary for survival, which also necessitates great expanses of land (Spear & Waller 10-11, 14). British colonialists formed their dominance over the Maasai by moving the them to “Native Reserves” in the Southern part of Kenya, lands that soon after became wildlife reserves (Akama 2002: 45). Land

2 Orientalism was originally an academic field, a way of studying the Orient, the Other, or the colonized, which essentialized and universalized a population that lives in a specific zone based on racial, geographical, cultural and political characteristics (Collins a).

alienation has made the pastoralist lifestyle difficult for the Maasai, many of whom have had to alter their means of survival.

In the case of the Maori, the indigenous people of New Zealand, they were *generalized* as sedentary warring hunter and gathers socially organized into *iwi*, tribes. In 1840, after years of trading with Europeans, Maori chiefs signed the Treaty of Waitangi, a controversial document to this day. By signing of the Treaty, the British gained sovereignty over New Zealand, but the Maori chiefs believed they had kept their right to sovereignty and had only signed over the right to governance (Hayward 2004). The Native Land Court was instated in 1862, to "...promote the peaceful settlement of the Colony and the advancement and civilization of the Natives" (Gilling 19). This legislation evolved into necessary individuation of land into titles that sought to eradicate the communal lifestyle of the Maori and alienate Maori from their land and livelihood.

These two brief generalizing contextualizations provide a base understanding of news media representations that will be the focus of my study. Such discursive forms have arisen over time to discuss the colonialist subject. One such type was the already mentioned notion of "Orientalism." Talking about the Orient was done in terms of Western values: the type of thought is "imaginative and yet drastically polarized geography dividing the world into two unequal parts, the larger, 'different' one called the Orient, the other, also known as 'our' world, called the Occident or the West" (Said 4). Again, originating out of the colonial contact, the discursive difference arises when "...one society or culture thinks about another one, different from it" (Said 4). This perspective of "us" versus "them" is the essence of colonial discourse.

An interesting observation made by Said recognizes that a culture seen as the Occident, or colonial power, is often smaller in size with the possibility of less productive power, making the Occident have to justify its power and dominance (Spurr 4). One such means of asserting dominance is in making unknown things known, naming the un-named in Eurocentric ways. This is inherent within colonialism, an assumption that deems the unknown "uncontrollable, chaotic, unattainable, and ultimately evil," necessitating taming and controlling (JanMohamed 64). The conqueror is faced with immediate differences in race, language, social customs, cultural values,

and modes of production. A choice is made whether the Other is identical or undeniably different, yet with either choice, the conqueror would place the Other only in relation to his/her own cultural perspective (JanMohamed 65). This same process is evident in the news media. Journalist name and portray cultures in ways that suit their own culture and understanding. By describing a culture to a reader, they are able to “know” them, framing their understanding based on this journalist’s notions of the indigenous community.

Based on the assumed superiority, the conqueror (or the journalist simply by the fact that they believe they can describe a culture they are not a part of) will “rarely question the validity of either his own or his society’s formation and that he will not be inclined to expend any energy in understanding the worthless alterity of the colonized” (JanMohamed 65). Assumed superiority therefore destroys the potential of the colonized for self-determination in such literature by affirming ethnocentric assumptions and preserving its justification, rather than putting it into question (JanMohamed 65). The literature becomes a mirror reflecting the colonialist’s self-image that even animalist representations form juxtaposition to the savior of the colonialist, while also informing their fear (JanMohamed 65; Spurr 4). The notion of the “savage as other,” for example, is recognition of self in the other, as the other is only defined in terms of the self, a distinction that could only be made within a situation of superiority (Spurr 7).³ In terms of journalism, Western populations largely access Western news media, with stories predominantly written by Western journalists (at least this was the discovery in my analysis). This limits Indigenous notions of the self infiltrating into Western media largely because of the audience, but also because of power-relations and access to Western journalists.

Spurr defines colonial discourse as “a way of creating and responding to reality that is infinitely adaptable in its function of preserving the basic structures of power” (Spurr 11). In this sense the

3 This notion of defining something only in relation to another is best understood by Jaques Derrida. He uses his idea of the trace to immediately confront an essential binary: that of the space of the white page (the margins, spaces between words) and the black markings (words, punctuation). Within this opposition between the white page and the black markings (which also denotes the binary between white and black) we create meaning through the interplay of the two. The discourse that is the black markings would be meaningless without the spaces (Derrida 9).

discourse can adapt to service the structure of power (Spurr 11). As mentioned above, the relations were first established during the colonial area, but this type of formal occupation is no longer acceptable, creating a new form of dominance in its place, neocolonialism. Following the oil crisis and other such indebted effects in the 1970s, newly independent states, much like Kenya, took loans from the World Bank to invest in projects that were intended to produce revenue and enable the economically lagging countries to catch up to their former colonizers. When many of these projects failed to be profitable, more loans were needed to repay the older loans, worsening the debt. To repay this increasing debt, the International Monetary Fund offered more loans with the requirement of implementing Structural Adjustment Policies (SAPs). Some policies cut public spending, intensified agriculture and/or increased exportation. This, in turn, reestablished the social-relations that existed during colonialism: the less technologically advanced and economically powerful became subject to the requirements of the more advanced and powerful.

By 1986, these economic policies imposed on Kenya, intending to stimulate economic growth, adversely impacted Kenya's economy and failed to reflect the dominant social structure, along with harsh and rapid implementation (Rono 82, 85). It became obvious that the IMF and World Bank, run by Western power-elite, shifted the purpose of the programs: the "programmes began with economic reforms and ended with the aim of addressing political problems, using Western political models that ignored the nation's stability and progress" (Rono 86). Once access to Kenya was secured by the created dependence on foreign loans, the Western elite were able to continue informally with material dominance.

During this same time, New Zealand's economic policy changed to *voluntarily* adopt structural adjustment policies that were normally enforced upon countries. These policies included "...market liberalization and free trade, limited government, a narrow monetarist policy, a deregulated labour market, and fiscal restraint" (Kelsey 1999). In essence, New Zealand embodied the neoliberal policies in the "New Zealand Experiment" to the full extent that Kelsey calls a "colossal failure" (Kelsey 1999). Not only did the economy do the opposite of grow, but New Zealand's

citizens also suffered. Unemployment was just one of the impacts, “the burden fell most heavily on those who already had the least: the Maori, the poor, the sick, women with children, and the unemployed” (Kelsey 1999). Choices had to be made between food or buying housing, health and education.

The change in policy also brought a change in the analysis of colonial discourse. The discussion now critiqued and analyzed the “expressions of traditionally Western ideals,” which have “served in the historical process of colonization” (Spurr 1). This is deemed to be post-colonialist literature, which uses rhetorical devices to uncover the common elements of colonialist writing. The difficulty in exposing such features is the simultaneous need to generalize and categorize (as done above with the example of the Maasai and Maori), which is antithetical to the goal. Spurr seeks to claim that nonfiction writing, specifically journalism, “depends on the use of myth, symbol, metaphor, and other rhetorical procedures more often associated with fiction and poetry” (Spurr 2-3). He also claims that journalism was not typically included in the rhetorical analysis, a possible reason owing to the belief in journalistic objectivity and accuracy, when in actuality, “journalism follows on more systematic orders of discourse, adapting them to particular events and translating them into language of popular appeal” (Spurr 2). It is important to note that at this point in the theory we start to see a shift from colonial representations to essentialized representations, both, as my analysis shows, are found in Western news media.

Van Ginneken has called this process of choosing specific language that appeals to the public “selective articulation.” Inherent in the process of providing news, journalists have to engage in a selective process. News media choose to bring to light certain aspects of reality while leaving others in the dark. Van Ginneken argues, “even such simple words upon closer inspection reveal very specific grids of selection and interpretation as to what is noteworthy and what is not” (Ginneken 22-23). Such selections, due to their nature of exclusivity, tend to essentialize the subject. Also, in the act of reporting an event, the journalist is automatically situated in a “privileged point of view,” creating a distance between the journalist and the subject (Spurr 14). By engaging in the act of observation, the journalist instantly excludes the self from the “object of

observation” (Spurr 13). This privileged perspective and distance are rarely acknowledged by the journalist, but instead is used to deem such observations as objective (Spurr 14).

This point of view is called “the gaze,” which references the act of looking through a distinct scope from which to view first employed by James Agee in the American South. The gaze not only creates a point of reference for observation, it also grounds such observation in ideologies that reinforce difference, a difference based on social-relations. The act of gazing is an “instrument of construction, order, and arrangement” that derives a certain amount of pleasure, as well as knowledge and power (Spurr 15). The gaze reduces primitive cultures to objects of pleasure or Western perception. Primitive cultures become the Other through the employing of “distance, difference and opposition,” which the gaze perpetuates, a difference that caters to Western thought (Spurr 25-26). When observing the Other, the journalist becomes very close range “... literally on the lookout for scenes that carry an already established *interest* for a Western audience, thus investing perception itself with the mediating power of cultural difference” (Spurr 21). In this way the journalist’s eye is selective for information or photographs that have significance to Western audiences (Spurr 21).

Finally, it is necessary to study contemporary news media and their representations of the two indigenous cultures. The methodological approach to the study follows standardized search criteria. Two mainstream online news media corporations were selected, one based in the United States, the NYTimes.com, and the other based in United Kingdom, BBC.co.uk. Within the NYTimes and BBC, the words “Maasai” and “Maori” were selected as the search subjects between January 1, 2011 and November 13, 2011. In the case of both media corporations, I found that the search “Maasai” was not sufficient and had to search a different spelling of the word, “Masai.” However, according to the Maasai Organization, “Masai” is an incorrect spelling and “Maasai” is the correct spelling (“An All Maasai Organization”). The articles were then examined for content to establish common patterns of news coverage.

Two main patterns have been identified throughout the 60 articles analyzed. The first is the use of colonial language. Words like “tribal,” “primitive,” “savage,” “traditional,” “customary,”

were counted as such. The second identified pattern was the use of stereotypical characteristics or essentialized features of the certain culture. For the Maasai, words like “Maasai checks,” “warrior,” or “jumping” were used as stereotypical characteristics, while words like “tattoos,” “haka,” or “warrior” were used as stereotypical characteristics for the Maori.

The NYTimes authors used colonial language in seven out of twenty-one articles for the Maasai and three out of fourteen articles for the Maori. In BBC, five out of nine articles for the Maasai contained colonial language and three out of sixteen used it for the Maori. Stereotypical language was used eight out of twenty-one articles for the Maasai and nine out of fourteen for the Maori. In BBC, five out of nine articles used stereotypical language for the Maasai and seven out of sixteen articles contained this language for the Maori.⁴

In the NYTimes and BBC there was a tendency to provide more stereotypical words rather than colonial words, but only in the case of the Maori. With the Maasai, there was a more even tendency between the two types of words. This suggests that the Maori have a different power-relation with Western countries than the Maasai. This can be backed up by the articles that discuss the Maori as the “national identity,” but do so in the context of discussing the national the museum.

In an article, “Wellington, New Zealand’s Flyover Capital, a Must-Stop,” advertising tourism in the New Zealand city of Wellington, minimal acknowledgement goes to the so claimed “national identity” (Todras-Whitehill). The majority of the article focuses on the popular culture of Wellington, like the unitard wearing street entertainment, bar scene and “Wellywood.” One paragraph mentions the Te Papa Tongarewa Museum when advising the visitor to gain “insight into New Zealand’s national identity.” The author describes the experience at the museum as having an “earthy, yet spiritual feel” and mentions two different exhibitions: “from the Bush City of native plants at ground level to the top level’s working marae, or meeting place, a traditional structure updated for the 21st century by contemporary Maori artists with whorls of pastel color.”

4 Note that some articles may have both colonial and stereotypical language in it, while some article may have neither.

This example seems to represent “traditional” Maori culture and not contemporary Maori culture, one that is very much incorporated into Western lifestyles.

This is then countered with the Maasai representation with the charitable aspect of some of the articles that would suggest a continuance of the paternalist relationship and one still based on colonial and contemporary relations. In the article, “Maasai Warrior Troupe Visits Poole,” the efforts of Maasai to raise money from Westerners for their village in Kenya is discussed. Maasai warriors put on two performances in Dorset:

They will perform their tribal song and dance and showcase their culture....John Curtin, Osiligi Charity Projects trustee, said: ‘The troupe’s performances are stunning and leave every audience totally elated and enchanted, having enjoyed an unforgettable experience. The singing and movement, like the Maasai’s way of life, are in perfect harmony and the jumping, for which they are famous, is mindboggling’ (“Maasai Warrior Troupe Visits Poole”).

Although the intention is to raise money for childhood education, the act elicits “the gaze” between the Western audience and the Maasai performers. The Maasai also play into the interests of Westerners and emphasize aspects of their culture that please and attract the Western audience. In doing so they perpetuate the stereotypical representations.

This is also the case with other groups that put on cultural performances. For the Maori, the haka is an essential aspect of every cultural performance, which helps to emphasize the warrior aspect of the culture. Although these two aspects or behaviors are part of Maori culture, they are not the essence of the culture. Thus, specific aspects of the culture are selected for the cultural performance, which coincide with the media representations that are ridden with stereotypical and colonial language. It seems as though the Maasai and the Māori have selected cultural aspects that Westerners would desire to see, confirming Spurr’s idea that media expresses Western ideals. These images maintain the colonial type relationship and serve the power-relations in a cyclical way.

It is important to note the lack of authors taking responsibility for their articles in the case of BBC, where as NYTimes always

provided authors for their articles. For the Maasai, only two articles out of the total nine gave authors, while only five out of sixteen articles gave authors for the articles on the Maori. Spurr would argue that journalism is better able to obscure imaginary representations when the author takes responsibility for the content, which “conceals the most obvious effects of ideology and suppresses the historical dimension of the interpretive categories that are brought into play” (Spurr 9). However, if the author denies responsibility then the notion of objectivity seems to be more removed.

Since stereotypes rather than colonial discourse seem to dominate the news media, it is important to understand that these representations may not be the ones the culture would choose to represent their entire community, much less an essentialized representation at all. Much like Said’s argument for Muslims and non-Muslims in Islam, this paper does not attempt to claim that there is a “real” Maasai or Maori culture that is suppressed, rather that a Westernized perception creates the dominant image in Western new media, instead of these culture’s own historical perspective (Said 44-45).

Said relates this imposition of representation to “communities of interpretation” (Said 45). As Said does not provide a precise definition of this concept, *Blogging the Globe* as a class defined it as, “groups of human beings who share history and experiences that produce and reproduce knowledge, interpretations and patterns of identity” (Collins b). Groups of people seek to produce agreeable identities as part of our process of understanding. Through meanings, designs and communication, interpretations are formed and influence the “consciousness as men have of their existence” (Said 46). The news media plays into these ideas since “‘news’ does not just happen, pictures and ideas do not merely spring from reality into our eyes and minds, truth is not directly available, we do not have unrestrained variety at our disposal” (Said 48). What information is made available, however, is shaped and filtered through the gaze, and for Said (49, 52) social relations play one of the most important roles in providing information (cf. Herman & Chomsky 2).

Edward Said argues that this type of thought process still exists today (although he discusses it in reference to the language about Islam) and does so to “...better blind ourselves not only to the world but to ourselves and to what our relationship to the so-

called Third World has really been” (Said 44). The content analysis proves the Maasai and the Maori are essentialized in their news media representations, which are enabled by age-old power-relations. However, the outing out of these same representations in their cultural performances cyclically reinforces these representations that originated out of colonialist discourse. By reinforcing the news media representations of indigenous cultures, the power-relations and discourse of the other are maintained.

Bibliography

- Akama, John. “The Creation of the Maasai Image and Tourism Development in Kenya.” *Cultural Tourism in Africa: Strategies for the New Millennium (proceedings of the ATLAS Africa International Conference: December 2000, Mombasa, Kenya)*. Ed. John Akama and Patricia Sterry. Arnhem, Netherlands: Association for Tourism and Leisure Education (ATLAS), 2002. 43-53. Print.
- “An All Maasai Organization.” *Maasai Association*. Web. 30 Nov. 2011. <<http://www.maasai-association.org/welcome.html>>.
- Collins, John (a). “Edward Said.” Blogging the Globe. St. Lawrence University, Canton. 31 Oct. 2011. Lecture.
- Collins, John (b). “Communities of Interpretation.” Blogging the Globe. St. Lawrence University, Canton. 2 Nov. 2011. Lecture.
- Derrida, Jacques. “Différance.” *Hydra*. Web. <<http://hydra.humanities.uci.edu/derrida/diff.html>>.
- Gilling, Bryan D. “The Maori Land Court In New Zealand: an Historical Overview.” 1993. Web. <www.brandonu.ca/library/cjns/13.1/gilling.pdf>.
- Ginneken, Jaap Van. *Understanding Global News: a Critical Introduction*. London: Sage Publications, 1999. Print.

- Grossberg, L., Wartella, E., & Whitney, D. C.. *Mediamaking: Mass Media in a Popular Culture*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE, 1998. Print.
- Hayward, J. (2004), 'Te Tiriti o Waitangi: The Treaty of Wiatangi' In: Ka'ai, T.M., Moorfield, J.C., Reilly, M.P.J. & Mosley, S. (eds) *Ki te Whaiao: An Introductions to Māori Culture and Society*, Auckland: Pearson Education, pp. 151-162.
- Herman, Edward S., and Noam Chomsky. *Manufacturing Consent: the Political Economy of the Mass Media*. New York: Pantheon, 1988. Print.
- JanMohamed, Abdul R. "The Economy of Manichean Allegory: The Function of Racial Difference in Colonialist Literature." *Critical Theory*12.1(1985): 59-87. *JSTOR*. Web. 12 Nov. 2011. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/1343462>>. M. M. Manhood
- Kelsey, Jane. "New Zealand "experiment" a Colossal Failure - Jane Kelsey." *Converge*. 9 July 1999. Web. 08 Dec. 2011. <<http://www.converge.org.nz/pma/apfail.htm>>.
- "Maasai Warrior Troupe Visits Poole." *BBC.co.uk*. 22 Oct. 2011. Web. 30 Nov. 2011. <<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-dorset-15391057>>.
- Rono, Joseph K. "The Impact of the Structural Adjustment Programmes on Kenyan Society." *Journal of Social Development in Africa* 17.1 (2002):81-98.
- Said, Edward W. *Covering Islam: How the Media and the Experts Determine How We See the Rest of the World*. New York: Vintage, 1997. Print.
- Spear, Thomas T., & Richard Waller. *Being Maasai: Ethnicity & Identity in East Africa*. London: James Currey, 1993. Print.
- Spurr, David. *The Rhetoric of Empire: Colonial Discourse in Journalism, Travel Writing and Imperial Administration*. Durham & London: Duke UP, 1993. Print.
- Todras-Whitehill, Ethan. "Wellington, New Zealand's Flyover Capital, a Must Stop." *NYTimes.com*. 02 Sept. 2011.